

# STATE OF ELECTORAL REFORMS IN PAKISTAN

**1<sup>st</sup>** Quarterly

Citizens Monitoring Report on the  
Implementation of the ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan

*As on December 31, 2011*

# STATE OF ELECTORAL REFORMS IN PAKISTAN

**1<sup>st</sup>** Quarterly

Citizens Monitoring Report on the  
Implementation of the ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan

*As on December 31, 2011*

PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: January 2012

ISBN: 978-969-558-284-0

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT

**Supported by**



**Published by**



**Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency - PILDAT**

**Head Office:** No. 7, 9th Avenue, F-8/1, Islamabad, Pakistan

Tel: (+92-51) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-51) 226 3078

**Lahore Office:** 45-A, Sector XX, 2nd Floor, Phase III Commercial Area, DHA, Lahore, Pakistan

Tel: (+92-42) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-42) 3569 3896

E-mail: [info@pildat.org](mailto:info@pildat.org); Web: [www.pildat.org](http://www.pildat.org)

# CONTENTS

## *Foreword*

## *Executive Summary*

- |   |    |
|---|----|
| 1. The Need for Electoral Reforms in Pakistan   | 12 |
| 2. ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan and its Significance for Electoral Reforms                             | 13 |
| 3. Objective and Format of the Citizens Monitoring Report   | 15 |
| 4. A Goal-by-Goal Analysis of the Progress on Strategic Plan  | 16 |
| 5. An Overview of the Status of Achieving Strategic Goals in the Plan                               | 23 |
| 6. Major Issues regarding Electoral Reforms which emerged or were discussed during the past quarter | 24 |
| 7. Major Election-related Issues expected to dominate political scene in the near future            | 27 |

## **Appendices**

- |             |   |    |
|-------------|---|----|
| Appendix A: | Breakdown of the ECP Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives  | 34 |
| Appendix B: | Goal-wise Progress Summary of the ECP Strategic Plan - As of December 31, 2011                                    | 35 |
| Appendix C: | Objectives-wise Progress on Implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan  | 36 |
| Appendix D: | Computerised Electoral Rolls - Time Line  | 42 |
| Appendix E: | Progress Report on Implementation of the 5-Year Strategic Plan - As of December 31, 2011 (As provided by the ECP) | 47 |



## Foreword

Participation of citizens in the political process and, more specifically, electoral process of a country is extremely important for making democracy inclusive and functional. The **State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan** is the *1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report on the Implementation of the ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan*. The report covers the status as of December 31, 2011.

The report is a manifestation of Pakistani citizens' deep interest in reforming the electoral system of Pakistan so that the coming election is free, fair and credible. Fortunately, the electoral reforms in Pakistan are no more an abstract idea. There is a specific blue print and a road map for electoral reforms in the form of a 5-year Strategic Plan prepared by the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) with the consultation and input of political parties and civil society organizations of Pakistan. It is rare for a public institution in Pakistan to develop such a road map and then take practical steps to implement it. The ECP deserves credit for undertaking such a serious exercise and remaining committed to implement it despite a number of challenges.

While the ECP has the responsibility to implement the 5-year strategic plan, it is the responsibility of the citizens to monitor the progress of implementation and raise questions where the progress is slow or stalled. PILDAT firmly believes that citizens monitoring will not be an effort in finger-pointing rather it will be helpful to ECP in overcoming obstacles in the way of timely implementation. The Monitoring Report will further strengthen the transparency in ECP operations which has tremendously improved over the past couple of years. We also believe that this monitoring report will also further promote public dialogue on electoral reforms and bring public and the ECP closer. This report will be helpful in identifying the areas of weakness early on so that efforts may be focused on expediting the implementation in those areas. Eventually, we believe, this report, which we plan to compile quarterly, will contribute towards the timely implementation of the Strategic Plan.

The percentage progress on each objective and goal given in the report has been carefully estimated by PILDAT based on the account of progress given by the ECP in its report placed in Appendix E. PILDAT will welcome any feedback regarding the estimates of percentage progress for incorporating in the next Quarterly Report.

## Acknowledgments

We wish to thank the **ECP** for providing us the information requested by us regarding the progress on the Strategic Plan and for sparing time to discuss the progress on various objectives of the Strategic Plan.

We also wish to thank the members of the **Citizens Group on Electoral Process (CGEP)** for their valuable input while reviewing the draft report.

This report is prepared by PILDAT under the project Supporting Monitoring of Democracy, Electoral Reforms and Development of Youth in Pakistan which is supported by the **Danish International Development Agency**, Government of Denmark.

## Disclaimer

The views expressed in this report are those of PILDAT and do not necessarily represent the views of DANIDA, the Government of Denmark and the Royal Danish Embassy Islamabad. PILDAT team of researchers has made every effort to ensure the accuracy of the data and analysis contained in this report and any omission or error is not deliberate.



## Executive Summary

The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) prepared and unveiled a *Five-Year Strategic Plan 2010-2014* on May 25, 2010. Under the Plan, a total of 129 objectives are listed under 15 Strategic Goals with deadline for achieving each objective. 7 objectives do not have a specific deadline as these relate to recurrent activities; 76 objectives were scheduled to be achieved by December 31, 2011. The remaining 46 objectives are scheduled to be achieved after 31 December 2011 – some as late as December 2014.

The progress made in achieving various Strategic Goals is as under:

1. **Improving Legal Framework for Elections (4 Objectives):** The Legal Framework Committee formed by the ECP has completed the draft package of laws which now awaits the formal approval of the Election Commission before it is sent to the Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs for further processing. Estimated Progress **33%**.
2. **Improvement in the Registration of Voters and Preparation of Credible, Accurate, Up-to-date and Accessible Electoral Rolls (12 Objectives):** ECP had originally fixed a deadline of December 2011 for the completion of revised computerized electoral rolls but now the ECP forecasts completion by end of May 2012 Estimated Progress: **75%**
3. **Improving the Election Operations (19 Objectives):** Simplification of Election-related forms and Feasibility Study of Electronic Voting Machines (EVMs) have been completed. The ECP is examining the feasibility Postal Ballots for Overseas Pakistanis. Progress on 9 objectives has already missed the target dates. Estimated Progress: **38%**
4. **Establishing an Effective and Transparent Election Complaints and Disputes Resolution Mechanism (4 Objectives):** The ECP is behind schedule on this goal. Designation of Officers to deal with election complaints at the Provincial Election Commission offices and in Islamabad was scheduled to be completed by June 2010 but very little progress has been made. Estimated Progress: **45%**
5. **Restructuring the Election Commission of Pakistan (7 Objectives):** The re-organization plan of the ECP has been developed and approved including the Budget in April 2010. The Organizational re-structuring of the ECP at the secretariat, Provincial, Divisional and Districts levels was due for completion by April 2010 but the work is still in progress. Estimated Progress: **42%**
6. **Improving the Infrastructure, Logistics and Equipment for ECP Offices (11 Objectives):** 60 % of the total estimated cost of US \$ 100 million for implementing the Strategic Plan relates to this goal. It is reported that ECP has been approaching the Government and international donors for funds. Some headway is made but no formal commitment is made as yet. Estimated Progress: **26%**
7. **Improving the Human Resources of the ECP (13 Objectives):** 10 objectives were scheduled to be achieved during 2010 but all these are behind schedule. A detailed Human Resource Policy is now being finalized. Estimated Progress: **48%**
8. **Attaining complete Financial Autonomy and appropriate Funding for ECP (4 Objectives):** ECP has moved a summary to the Prime Minister for complete financial autonomy on the pattern of National Assembly and the Senate. This objective was to be realized by December. Another objective was to raise funds to the tune of US \$ 100 Million for the implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan between 2010 and 2012. Reportedly, no firm commitment has so far materialized and negotiation with donors like USAID, UNDP and CIDA are on-going. Estimated Progress: **28%**
9. **Institutionalizing Training, Research and Evaluation in ECP (17 Objectives):** 15 dedicated positions headed by a Grade-20 Additional Director General (ADG) have been created for strengthening the Federal Election Academy. 18 Training Manuals and Handbooks have so far been developed. Estimated Progress: **60%**
10. **Promoting the use of Information Technology in ECP operations (8 Objectives):** A comprehensive IT policy for ECP was



to be formulated by December 2010. The IT Wing of ECP has prepared the first draft in January 2011 which is sent for comments to National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA) and other institutions. Strengthening of IT infrastructure at the ECP offices across the country, which was scheduled to be completed by December 2011, is still in progress. The re-design of the ECP website, scheduled for December 2011, has been accomplished. Restructuring of the IT Directorate and provincial setups was to be completed by December 2010 but is not yet complete. Estimated Progress: **61%**

- 11. Improving Public Outreach and Interaction with Political Parties, Civil Society Organisations and the Media (5 Objectives):** The ECP has established two Political Parties Consultative Forum and Civil Society Consultative Forum and consulted them on Strategic Plan and Electronic Voting Machines. A permanent Media Centre, which was scheduled for December 2011, is however, not established yet. The plan to publish an ECP Quarterly Newsletter is scheduled for December 2012 but its early implementation is strongly recommended. Estimated Progress: **25%**
- 12. Strengthening of participation of Political Parties and Candidates (6 Objectives):** Electoral Legal Framework Committee of the ECP is considering proposals to make appropriate legal amendments to improve transparency of political finance. The ECP had committed to upload the Annual Statements of Assets and Liabilities submitted by all legislators on the ECP website by October 2010 but no progress has been made so far. Recently media reports indicate that the ECP has decided not to publish these statements on the ECP website. This is rather disappointing and runs counter to the principle of transparency and the spirit of the law. Strengthening Political Parties Code of Conduct was to be completed by June 2011 but so far a draft is initiated by ECP for stakeholders' input. Estimated Progress: **20%**
- 13. Enhancing the Participation of Voters and Improving the Civic and Voter Education (10 Objectives):** The main objective of this goal is to enhance the voter turnout from 44 % (2008 General Election) to 63 % in the next General Election. The ECP has undertaken the baseline survey to ascertain factors influencing participation in order to formulate appropriate strategies to enhance their participation in the electoral process. The ECP was scheduled to develop a Civic and Voter Education Strategy by December 2011 but this work is still in progress. Estimated Progress: **66%**
- 14. Improving the participation of Marginalised Groups including Women, Minorities and Persons with Disabilities in the Electoral Process (6 Objectives):** The ECP was to support the adoption of legislation on participation of persons with disabilities by December 2011. No such legislation has been initiated so far but names of transgenders have been included in the Electoral Rolls on the direction of the Supreme Court. The ECP was to develop and implement policies and procedures for enhancing the electoral participation of women by December 2010. No such policies or procedures have been developed or implemented so far. Estimated Progress: **12%**
- 15. Creating a refreshing and dynamic branding of the Election Commission of Pakistan (3 Objectives):** Under this goal, the ECP was to develop, by December 2010, a distinct uniform design for the divisional and district office buildings and signboards for all across the country. No tangible progress has so far been made on this objective. The ECP was also to develop an ECP branding using specific colour combinations for all items it uses by December 2010. It is reported that some new designs are developed which are under consideration by the ECP. Estimated Progress: **35%**

## Overall Progress

As of December 31, 2011, the average overall progress made on 76 objectives which were scheduled to be completed by December 31, 2011 is assessed to be **36 %**, whereas this progress should have been 100 %. This is not a satisfactory performance but one hopes that this assessment will prove to be a shot in the arm and the efforts to achieve progress as per the Strategic Plan will be expedited.

The average overall progress made on 46 objectives, whose realization is due after December 31, 2011, is assessed to be **12%**.

The overall progress on the Strategic Plan is estimated to be **48 % (36 % + 12 %)** as of December 31, 2011.

**Major Issues of Electoral Reforms during the past quarter**

1. **Electoral Rolls** remained the most important electoral issue during the past 3 months.
2. The ECP suspended the membership of 231 national and provincial legislators on October 21, 2011 when they **failed to submit statements of their assets and liabilities within the stipulated period as per law.**
3. The ECP, to its credit, raised the question of **political finance** and the need for introducing reforms in this context. On November 7, 2011, the ECP announced that it was establishing a 'Political Finance Wing' as a first step to eliminate corruption from politics.

**Major Issues of Electoral Reforms expected in the next quarter and beyond:**

1. **Electoral Rolls** and deadline set by the Supreme Court;
2. The date of the **next Parliamentary Election**
3. Election in the presence of a partisan President and partisan Provincial Governors
4. The **consultative process for the formation of Caretaker Governments;**
5. Appointment of the new **Chief Election Commissioner (CEC) by March 2012**, and
6. **Term (2 or 5 years) of current members of the Election Commission** will remain the subjects of intense debate during the next few months.



## **The Need for Electoral Reforms in Pakistan**

Pakistan has held 9 national and provincial general elections on the basis of adult franchise since its coming into existence in 1947. Eight of these General Elections have been held after the 1973 Constitution was passed. In general these elections have suffered from a low voter turn-out which has been steadily going down since 1970 election. The highest voter turn-out was in 1970 election which was recorded as 63.4 %. The lowest turn-out was in 1997 general election when only 35.4 % voters turned out to vote. The situation only marginally improved during the latest general election in 2008 when the voter turn-out was 44.4 %. The average voter turn-out for the last eight general elections (excluding 1977 election which was largely believed to be rigged) works out to be 45.9 % which makes Pakistan a country with the lowest voter turn-out among the countries of South Asia and sixth from the bottom among 169 countries whose average voter turn-out statistics were compiled by IIDEA, an international inter-government organization based in Sweden.

One of the possible explanations for this low voter turn-out is the voters' lack of trust in the electoral system. This weak credibility of the electoral system in general and the Election Commission of Pakistan in particular is at the heart of the weak political system in the country. In addition, electoral rolls are generally not trusted by voters, political parties and the candidates. Multiple voter registration is common and a large number of bogus votes are also included in the rolls. Powers of the Election Commission and limiting the selection of Chief Election Commissioner and the Election Commissioners to former judges are some of the other issues which need to be addressed and reformed. Inability of the Election Commission to enforce the election expenses limits is a major problem and a discouraging factor for the participation of a person of modest means in the electoral process. Election disputes resolution process is very lengthy and complicated and fails to discourage candidates to commit electoral irregularities. Questions are also raised about the impartiality and competence of Polling Staff. Senior government officials including Prime Ministers and Ministers generally use government resources to influence voters' choice in favour of their favourite candidates during by-election. In view of these key issues, electoral reforms are critical for democracy and peace of Pakistan. If credibility of electoral process is destroyed, it strengthens undemocratic forces and encourages extremism and violence. PILDAT has

extensively worked on formulating proposals for Electoral Reforms since 2005.

Due to these and other efforts, the ECP has included many of these reform proposals in its Five Year Strategic Plan 2010-2014. Some of the targets set in the plan are already late and the process of electoral reforms is generally slow. The next general election can be called any time, like in any parliamentary democracy. In any case the next general election is to be held no later than May 2013. It is important that the citizens should monitor the implementation of the electoral reforms process using the ECP Strategic Plan as a tool. PILDAT has held two citizens workshops to discuss the progress on the ECP Strategic Plan and feels that a regular periodic review by the citizens and its dissemination through the media will speed up the reform process.

## The ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan and its significance for Electoral Reforms

### *The Significance of the ECP Strategic Plan*

The Election Commission of Pakistan prepared and unveiled a Five-Year Strategic Plan 2010-2014 on May 25, 2010. This is probably the first time in the history of Pakistan that the body constitutionally responsible for conducting elections in the country has taken a strategic view of the question of Electoral Reforms and documented its plans to introduce these reforms.

The ECP also detailed these reforms into objectives and set a deadline for realizing each of these objectives. It has therefore become possible to see the comprehensive picture of the Electoral Reforms in Pakistan and monitor the progress made and see what more needs to be done. The development, adoption and publicity of the Strategic Plan is an important landmark in the political and electoral history of Pakistan and the CEC, ECP members, Secretary and the staff should be complimented for not only developing such an important document but also for continuing to make efforts to implement it.

The ECP undertook consultations with Civil Society Organizations and Political Parties of Pakistan while finalizing the Strategic Plan. PILDAT was one of those organizations which actively participated in these consultations. The Strategic Plan, therefore, enjoys a societal ownership and it is the duty of the citizens to monitor its progress on implementation and make the findings of this exercise public so that the society as a whole may generate the required momentum for timely implementation of the strategic Plan.

### *What is the ECP Strategic Plan?*

Under the ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan, 15 Strategic Goals have been set by the ECP. The goals are multi-faceted and complex, and will require a high degree of commitment to realize them. The ECP has undertaken to deploy all possible efforts to achieve these goals. Each strategic goal is further sub-divided into a number of objectives and a deadline has been fixed for achieving each objective. A total of 129 objectives are listed under 15 strategic goals. The number of objectives under each strategic goal range from 3 to 19.

The ECP has estimated that the implementation of the entire 5-year Strategic Plan will require a funding of approximately US \$ 100 Million. The ECP is discussing the possibility of funding with a number of donors such as the USAID, the UNDP and the CIDA but no firm commitment is known to have been made so far except a commitment of US \$ 8.5 Million made by the USAID.

Following are the ECP Strategic Goals:

#### **Strategic Goal No. 1: Improving Legal Framework for Elections (4 Objectives)**

To ensure that the laws governing functions of the ECP and conduct of elections meet international standards and are complete, clear and understandable, and are put together in a way that their usage becomes easier and productive.

#### **Strategic Goal No. 2: Improvement in the Registration of Voters and Preparation of Credible, Accurate, Up-to-date and Accessible Electoral Rolls (12 Objectives)**

To ensure that there is comprehensive voter registration and the electoral rolls are credible, accurate, fairly prepared and updated through annual revision according to the law by using modern technologies and other appropriate methods, and that the rolls are accessible to all stakeholders.

#### **Strategic Goal No. 3: Improving the Election Operations (19 Objectives)**

To enhance institutional capacity for managing election operations smoothly and efficiently, making them voter friendly, and reducing the number of complaints and disputes by increasing the level of credibility of the electoral process.

#### **Strategic Goal No. 4: Establishing an Effective and Transparent Election Complaints and Disputes Resolution Mechanism (4 Objectives)**

To establish an effective and transparent election complaints and disputes resolution mechanism that contributes towards strengthening the overall electoral system.

#### **Strategic Goal No. 5: Restructuring the Election Commission of Pakistan (7 Objectives)**

To re-organise the ECP structure in technical, legal, operational, administrative, and financial domains to enhance its effectiveness, ensure smooth operations and strengthen its professional capacity.

**Strategic Goal No. 6: Improving the Infrastructure, Logistics and Equipment for ECP Offices (11 Objectives)**

To improve the working environment for staff and provide relevant and needed support in terms of equipment and accommodation to support the ECP's efficient conduct of the electoral process, including its outreach to the public.

**Strategic Goal No. 7: Improving the Human Resources of the ECP (13 Objectives)**

To have a modern human resource management system for meeting current and future challenges, ensuring that staff are hired according to established policy, are well-compensated, are promoted on the basis of merit, and that staff composition is diverse and representative of the nation that the ECP serves.

**Strategic Goal No. 8: Attaining Complete Financial Autonomy and appropriate Funding for ECP (4 Objectives)**

To attain complete financial autonomy for the ECP and ensure sufficient funds on a regular basis to manage its functions effectively.

**Strategic Goal No. 9: Institutionalizing Training, Research and Evaluation in ECP (17 Objectives)**

To institutionalize training, research and evaluation in order to strengthen the ECP's policy-making processes and build the capacity of the officers and staff leading to enhanced level of performance.

**Strategic Goal No. 10: Promoting the use of Information Technology in ECP operations (8 Objectives)**

To strengthen information technology as a strategic resource in the ECP's planning and decision-making functions with a view to improving efficiency and productivity in the electoral processes and also ensuring that public has access to the relevant electoral information.

**Strategic Goal No.11: Improving Public Outreach and Interaction with Political Parties, Civil Society Organisations and the Media (5 Objectives)**

To reach out to key stakeholders including political parties, candidates, civil society organisations, the media and general public in order to strengthen their trust in the electoral processes and to increase their participation in the electoral matters through regular consultations.

**Strategic Goal No. 12: Strengthening of participation of Political Parties and Candidates (6 Objectives)**

To strengthen the informed and lawful participation of

political parties and candidates in the electoral processes.

**Strategic Goal No. 13: Enhancing the Participation of Voters and improving the Civic and Voter Education (10 Objectives)**

To create awareness amongst voters of all ages and all sections of society in order to increase their full participation in the electoral process by undertaking civic and voter education.

**Strategic Goal No. 14: Improving the participation of Marginalized Groups including Women, Minorities and Persons with Disabilities in the Electoral Process (6 Objectives)**

To formulate laws and strictly implement them to ensure that marginalized groups including women, minorities and persons with disabilities are able to participate in the political and electoral processes.

**Strategic Goal No. 15: Creating a refreshing and dynamic branding of the Election Commission of Pakistan (3 Objectives)**

To create a refreshing and dynamic identity of the ECP leading to a change in the perception of the common people and public functionaries at all levels.

## **Objective and Format of the Citizens Monitoring Report**

### **Objective**

The objectives of the Citizens Monitoring Report are manifold. The report is meant to enhance the public awareness about the pace and extent of implementation of Electoral Reforms and this, in turn, is expected to improve the involvement and ownership of the general public of the electoral process.

In addition, the regular and close monitoring of the progress of implementation will help ECP and other relevant institutions to be vigilant and careful about the timely implementation of the Plan.

The report will also help the media to accurately assess the progress on implementing Electoral Reforms in the country and highlight the issues and obstacles in time so that the decision-makers may be able to take timely action.

The report will also be disseminated to the parliamentarians and other decision-makers which will help them in engaging in informed and meaningful debate and reaching the right conclusions about electoral reforms.

### **Format**

The report is organized in such a way that it can highlight the key points and the most important issues relating to the implementation of Strategic Plan in an easy to understand and non-technical language. In addition to the concise presentation of key points, an appendix presents the detailed progress by discussing each of the 129 objectives included in the strategic Plan.

## A Goal-by-Goal Analysis of the progress on Strategic Plan

### Goal 1: Improving Legal Framework for Elections

This goal is meant to ensure that the laws governing functions of the ECP and conduct of elections meet international standards and are complete, clean and understandable and are put together in a way that their usage becomes easier and productive.

The Legal Framework Committee formed by the ECP on September 7, 2010 has completed the draft package of laws which now awaits the formal approval of the Election Commission before it is sent to the Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs for further processing through its internal mechanisms and the Federal Cabinet. After the Cabinet approval, the package of laws will be introduced as a bill in one of the houses of the Parliament. Usually at least one of the two houses refers bills to the Standing Committee on Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs. After the committee clears the bill, it will be placed before the full House for approval and forwarding to the other House. After the approval by the second House, the bill will be sent to the President for his assent after which it will become an act of Parliament. In case there is a disagreement on the bill between the two Houses, the reconciliation efforts may also be required. Apparently, the entire process of approval will take a long time because multiple laws are involved and forging a consensus within the standing committees and the two Houses will not be easy in this period when General Election appears to be imminent.

The ECP had scheduled the realization of this objective for December 2010. Unfortunately it has proven to be too ambitious and so far, as we reach January 2012, the progress on this objective can, at best, be assessed at 50 %. The unification of different electoral laws was also scheduled to be completed by December 2010. Progress on this objective is also assessed to be at 50 %. A draft unified package has been prepared but it is yet to be formally approved by the ECP.

Enhancing public understanding of these laws through Urdu translation was to be completed by December 2011 but this work is also delayed. Realization of the objectives under this goal are behind schedule by about 12 months so far but this delay may extend to many years as the best time to pass such laws has already been lost.

The ECP should, however, be commended for compiling a draft package of laws and this effort will not go waste as sooner or later these laws will have to be passed by the Parliament.

Overall progress on the objectives scheduled to be completed by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is assessed to be **33 %**.

### Goal 2: Improvement in the Registration of Voters and Preparation of Credible, Accurate, Up-to-date and Accessible Electoral Rolls

Among the 15 Goals of the ECP Strategic Plan, this Goal is probably the most important and is the focus of the greatest attention by the political parties, Judiciary, civil society and general public.

As the election date is drawing closer (the latest date of holding next National Assembly election is May 2013), the interest in the new and accurate electoral rolls is turning into concern and worry.

The ECP had initially fixed a deadline of December 31, 2011 for the completion of revised computerized electoral rolls. Later it moved the deadline to March 24, 2012 reportedly due to the increase in the number of Census Blocks by the Census Organization. It is arguable whether adoption of the new Census Blocks was the right thing to do especially because this increase appeared arbitrary and disproportionate and Census did not go ahead on the basis of these census blocks.

Later the ECP moved the deadline to April 3, 2012 reportedly because of movement of a large segment of the population after heavy rains and floods in Sindh and KP which delayed the door-to-door verification more difficult.

The ECP now forecasts completion of this work by **May 27, 2012**. The latest change has also come about reportedly due to the extension in door-to-door verification campaign. This exercise was originally planned to take 41 days but has actually consumed 86 days.

The Supreme Court has not accepted the ECP reasons for the delay and has directed the ECP to complete final electoral rolls by **February 23, 2012**.

These dates assume a great significance when we look at the campaign of the largest opposition political party, the PML-N, to force an early election and dissolution of the



National and Provincial Assemblies before the Senate election scheduled by March 2012 and the strong PPP interest in not accepting this demand so that the Senate election may take place in March 2012 as scheduled resulting in significant gains for the PPP.

Discrediting the Electoral Rolls 2007 by the Election Commission and delay in the preparation of new electoral rolls to May 2012 has strengthened the PPP argument of not holding an early election.

What is probably even more critical, the ECP, contrary to its constitutional obligations (Article 219 a), the Electoral Rolls Act, 1974 (Section 17) and in contravention of the Objective 12 of this goal, has failed to update the current Electoral Rolls annually for the past four years since 2009. The current Electoral Rolls are thus outdated by 4 years and, as some would argue, unusable for a snap election. The Supreme Court has taken exception to this apparent failure of the ECP to abide by this constitutional obligation.

The ECP has, however, taken some landmark decisions during the past 3 years which have laid a strong foundation for accurate and credible electoral rolls. Some of these important decisions are as follows:

- i. Entering into an arrangement with National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA) for using its database and its technical infrastructure for new electoral rolls
- ii. Successfully piloting a bill and getting it passed by the Parliament making it mandatory to hold a Computerised National Identification Card (CNIC) issued by NADRA for the purpose of registration as a voter and for casting vote at the polls. This has ensured that multiple entries of a voter which had been a major source of inaccuracy in electoral rolls and malpractices at the time of polling will be effectively eliminated
- iii. Including Voter's picture in the Electoral Rolls
- iv. Holding consultations with political parties and civil society for developing credible and accurate Electoral Rolls

Preparation of accurate, up to date and credible electoral rolls is critical to holding a free, fair and credible election. Back in 2007, the ECP and the nation failed to prepare a computerized, accurate, up-to-date and credible electoral roll despite spending a huge sum in excess of Rs. 1 billion. At that time, Supreme Court had directed the ECP to

complete the new electoral rolls within a tight time frame and even prescribed the amalgamation of 2002 electoral rolls with 2007 electoral roll which compounded the problem of multiple entries of votes and unverified voters.

The preparation of new Electoral Rolls has entered a critical phase in 2012. One may argue that the ECP should have worked a little more efficiently to meet the original deadline of preparing final electoral rolls by December 31, 2011.

One may also question the benefit compared to the cost (both monetary and in terms of time) of undertaking door-to-door verification. One may also criticize the decision to prematurely adopt the new Census Blocks which delayed the preparation of Electoral Rolls by some three (3) months. But rushing through the remaining phase of the preparation of electoral rolls may once again lead to less than satisfactory quality of voters list. It may be critical to complete the new electoral rolls at an early date but perhaps it is equally, if not more important, that these rolls are accurate, up-to-date and trustworthy.

The ECP is spending over Rs. 2 Billion in preparing the new Electoral Rolls. The NADRA is currently busy incorporating a large number of changes resulting from the door-to-door verification campaign which reportedly led to the collection of 14 million forms containing corrections, deletions etc. far in excess of 4 million such forms which NADRA had anticipated. This means NADRA has to deploy more than three times the resources for generating the Preliminary Electoral Rolls compared to what it had originally anticipated to meet the May 27 deadline.

After this exercise is completed, the ECP will then need to print sufficient number of copies to display the preliminary electoral rolls at some 55000 locations throughout the country.

The ECP is bound by law (The Electoral Rolls Act, 1974, Section 10) to display these preliminary rolls for minimum 21 days for inviting public objections and complaints and applications for corrections. A further period will be required to incorporate the changes resulting from the received objections and applications. In the end, time is also required for printing the final rolls.

As of January 12, 2012, when the Honourable Supreme Court has reiterated the deadline of February 23, 2012, only 42 days are available to meet the deadline fixed by the Honourable Supreme Court. There is an apprehension that

in order to meet the deadline, the ECP and NADRA may cut some corners and as a result we may once again end up with such sub-standard electoral rolls which are neither accurate nor credible.

The ECP has a responsibility to convey the practical and technical problems in meeting the deadline and the risks involved in rushing through the process to the Honourable Supreme Court. We hope that the Honourable Supreme Court will grant a patient hearing to the ECP and the NADRA and take a more magnanimous view in the interest of greater accuracy and higher credibility of electoral rolls and grant extension in the deadline if it finds the ECP arguments convincing.

The overall progress on the Strategic Goal 2: Preparation of the New Computerised Electoral Rolls is assessed to be **75%**.

**Goal 3: Improving the Election Operations (Permanent, better and more Polling Stations; Database of Polling staff; Electronic Voting Machines etc.)**

This goal has the largest number of objectives (19) among all the 15 goals. It has a great variety of target improvements ranging from Polling Stations, Polling Staff, Electronic Voting Machines (EVM), CCTV Monitoring, Election-related forms, Result Management System, Postal Ballots, Code for Polling Agents, Access to Election Observers, Voting material to Security arrangements.

In general, work on this goal is in progress. Election-related forms have already been simplified; Feasibility Study of EVMs has been completed and the ECP appears to be ready to employ these EVMs as a pilot project in some selected constituencies.

The ECP is considering the feasibility of using postal ballots for giving voting right to Overseas Pakistanis. ECP, however, estimated that the exercise would cost the commission US \$ 200 for a single overseas vote, compared to Rs. 10 within the country. The NADRA figures indicate that 4.4 million national identity cards (NICOP) have been issued to overseas Pakistanis living in 20 countries.

Out of 19 objectives, two are not time-bound as these are recurring activities; two are already accomplished; 6 are scheduled to be achieved later in 2012 or 2013 but the progress on the remaining 9 objectives has already missed the target dates which were between October 2010 and

December 2011.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under Strategic Goal 3 is **16 %**. Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **22%** with an overall progress on the Goal estimated at **38%**.

**Goal 4: Establishing an Effective and Transparent Election Complaints and Disputes Resolution Mechanism**

In general, the ECP is behind schedule on this goal.

Designation of Officers to deal with election complaints at the Provincial Election Commission offices and in Islamabad was scheduled to be completed by June 2010. Apparently very little progress has been made on this and the objective may be realised by the end of 2012.

Legislation for electoral dispute resolution system was scheduled to be completed by July 2011 but it has not yet been realized. It is reported that this legislation may also be included in the package of laws currently being considered by the ECP under Goal 1.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for the completion by December 31, 2011 under Strategic Goal 4 is **25%**. Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **20%** with an overall progress on the Goal estimated at **45%**.

**Goal 5: Restructuring the Election Commission of Pakistan**

The objective of this goal is to re-organize the ECP structure in technical, legal, operational, administrative and financial domains to enhance its effectiveness. Ensure smooth operations and strengthen its professional capacity.

It is reported that the re-organization plan of the ECP has been developed and approved including the Budget in April 2010. The Organizational re-structuring of the ECP at the secretariat as well as the Provincial, Divisional and Districts levels was due for completion by April 2010 but the work is still in progress. Some new positions such as that of an Additional Secretary at the Head Office have been created and staff appointed. A Training, Research and Evaluation Wing has been created in the ECP. An Electoral Rolls Unit has also been created at the ECP Secretariat. Work on the strengthening of Federal Election Academy

was to be completed by December 2010 but the progress on this objective is only **50 %** complete.

In general, this goal is assessed to be **42 %** complete.

#### **Goal 6: Improving the Infrastructure, Logistics and Equipment for ECP Offices**

The objective of this goal is to improve the work environment of the staff and provide relevant and needed support in terms of equipment and accommodation, as well as to support the ECP's efficient conduct.

This goal is capital-intensive and attaining this goal will greatly depend upon the availability of funds. The ECP reported that the Goal as a whole has made no progress due to non-availability of funds. The Goal is estimated to consume nearly **60 %** of the US \$ 100 Million estimated budget of the Strategic Plan over five (5) years.

It is reported that the ECP has been approaching the Government and international donors for more funds. USAID initially indicated to provide US \$ 35 Million for the Strategic Plan but this amount has lately been reduced to US \$ 8.5 Million. The ECP has reported that '*Nothing has been materialized so far.*'

5 out of 9 objectives under this goal are not due yet. The remaining 4 objectives which were due for completion by now have not been realized except for the comprehensive need assessment of the ECP infrastructure, logistics and equipment which has been prepared by the ECP.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is **26%**.

#### **Goal 7: Improving the Human Resources of the ECP**

3 out of 13 objectives under this goal are not yet due.

The remaining 10 objectives were scheduled to be achieved during 2010 but all these are in progress yet.

An initial draft of a detailed Human Resource Policy is reported to be developed and is now being finalized. Job Descriptions of each position in the ECP have also been written. Training of the ECP officials for the role of District Returning Officers (DROs), Returning Officers (ROs) and Assistant Returning Officers (AROs) has commenced.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled

for completion by December 31, 2011 under this strategic Goal is **45 %**.

Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **3 %** with an overall progress on the Goal estimated at **48 %**.

#### **Goal 8: Attaining complete Financial Autonomy and appropriate Funding for ECP**

The objective of this goal is to attain complete financial autonomy for the ECP and ensure sufficient funds on regular basis to manage its functions effectively.

The ECP has reportedly submitted a summary to the Prime Minister for moving legislation to grant complete financial autonomy to the ECP on the pattern of the National Assembly and the Senate.

This important objective was scheduled to be realized by December 2010 but the ECP proposal has not yet made a tangible progress and is at an early stage of legislative cycle.

An important objective under this goal was to raise funds to the tune of US \$ 100 Million for the implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan during the period between 2010 and 2012. Reportedly only US \$ 8.5 Million have so far been committed by the USAID. Negotiation with other donors for the balance amount is still in progress.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is **8%**.

Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **20 %** with an overall progress on the Goal estimated at **28 %**.

#### **Goal 9: Institutionalizing Training, Research and Evaluation in ECP**

An effective electoral system depends a great deal on well-trained human resource both within the ECP and outside among various stake holders such as Polling Staff coming from other government departments and Polling Agents appointed by various candidates and political parties.

The ECP had been organizing training of its own staff and Polling Staff from other departments closer to election in the past through arrangements with various donors such as UNDP.

There was a need to put in place a system and institutionalizing the training programme so that this gigantic task could be undertaken on a continuous basis as an on-going activity. For this purpose, the ECP had planned to strengthen the Federal Election Academy which at present is housed within the ECP building in Islamabad since 2004.

Some important steps have been taken for strengthening the academy such as the creation of 15 dedicated positions headed by a Grade-20 Additional Director General (ADG). The ADG has been posted in January 2012. Work is in progress on the training of polling Officials, ECP Staff, Political Parties polling Agents, Security staff, etc., are various other objectives which are scheduled to complete on dates ranging from December 2012 to December 2014.

As of December 31, 2011, 365 ECP Officers, 5210 Presiding Officers / Polling Staff and 171 Electoral Rolls Verifying Officials were trained. In addition 30 Deputy Election Commissioners (DECs) and Assistant Election Commissioners (AECs) have been trained as Master Trainers to impart training to other staff. 20 DECs and AECs have been trained in the role of DROs/ROs as future resource persons in the ECP. Development of curricula for various training programmes was scheduled to be completed by December 2011. It is reported that a variety of training material has either been developed or existing material has been revised and updated. 18 Training Manuals and Handbooks have so far been developed.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is **42 %**. Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **18 %** with an overall progress on the goal estimated at **60 %**.

#### **Goal 10: Promoting the use of Information Technology in ECP operations**

The objective of this goal is to strengthen information technology as a strategic resource in the ECP's planning and decision making functions with a view to improve efficiency and productivity in the electoral process and also ensure that public has access to the relevant electoral information.

A comprehensive IT policy for the ECP was to be formulated by December 2010.

It is understood that the IT Wing of the ECP has prepared

the first draft of the IT Policy in January 2011 which is currently being shared with the NADRA and other institutions for their input. Strengthening of IT infrastructure at the ECP offices across the country which was scheduled to be completed by December 2011 is still in progress.

The re-design of the ECP website which was scheduled to be completed by December 2011 has been accomplished.

Restructuring of the IT Directorate and IT set up in the provincial offices was scheduled to be completed by December 2010. The objective has been largely achieved.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is **41 %**. Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **20 %** with an overall progress on the Goal estimated at **61 %**.

#### **Goal 11: Improving Public Outreach and Interaction with Political Parties, Civil Society Organisations and the Media**

The objective of this goal is to reach out to the stake holders including the political parties, candidates, civil societies, the media, and the general public in order to strengthen their trust in the electoral process and to increase participation in electoral matters through regular consultations.

The ECP has traditionally been an introvert organization with very little interaction with political parties and civil society. The channels for media interaction had also been weak and mostly used for one-way communication from the ECP to the media. Inter-active fora did not exist.

Things have considerably changed since the present Honourable Chief Election Commissioner and the Secretary ECP assumed their positions. The ECP has established two formal forums: Political Parties Consultative Forum and the Civil Society Consultative Forum. The two forums have been consulted on Strategic Plan and Electronic Voting Machines.

The ECP has also become more receptive to interaction at the initiative of individual political parties or Civil Society Organizations CSOs. The ECP has held 3 formal consultations with political parties and 2 with CSO. One may argue that there should be more frequent interaction with political parties, CSOs and Media.

The ECP has, however, been unable to establish a permanent Media Centre at the ECP which was scheduled for establishment by December 2011. The plan to publish an ECP Quarterly Newsletter is scheduled to commence in December 2012 but we feel that given the urgent need to share information with people at large and specific stakeholders like political parties and CSOs, the ECP should urgently start disseminating a monthly newsletter through internet and in print forthwith. Its Urdu version is a must and English version will be of added benefit. After the next general election, the ECP may change the periodicity of the Newsletter to quarterly.

The progress on achieving the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is assessed to be **Zero** %, however **25** % progress is assessed on the objectives which are scheduled for completion on dates after December 31, 2011. The overall progress for this goal is assessed at **25** %.

#### **Goal 12: Strengthening participation of Political Parties and Candidates and Ensuring greater transparency in Political Finance**

There are a total six objectives under this goal. Four of these objectives relate to reforms in political finance and the remaining two are about strengthening code of conduct for political parties and training of political party representatives and candidates.

The ECP should be commended for taking up the serious issues relating to Political Finance. Electoral Legal Framework Committee of the ECP is considering different proposals to make appropriate legal amendments to improve transparency of political finance.

The ECP had committed under this goal to upload the Annual Statements of Assets and Liabilities submitted by all national and provincial legislators on the ECP website. This objective was to be realized by October 2010 but despite repeated reminders by PILDAT, progress was not made on this front. Recently media reports indicate that the ECP has decided not to publish these statements on the ECP website. This is rather disappointing and runs counter to the principle of transparency and the spirit of the law which requires these statements to be published for public knowledge in the government gazette.

Strengthening Political Parties Code of Conduct was to be completed by June 2011 but no tangible progress seems to have been made in this regard. The ECP circulated draft Codes of Conduct among the participants of the

Consultative Forum organized on January 23, 2012. Probably the best way to strengthen the Code of Conduct is to incorporate its provisions in the electoral laws.

Training of Political Parties representatives and candidates is scheduled for November 2012. The ECP should begin delivering this training urgently as the election season is on and a large number of candidates and party officials will need to be trained which consumes a lot of time.

The progress on achieving the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is assessed to be **20** %.

#### **Goal 13: Enhancing the Participation of Voters and improving the Civic and Voter Education**

The main objective of this goal is to enhance the voter turnout from 44 % (2008 General Election) to 63 % of registered voters in the next General Election scheduled by 2013.

The ECP had planned to undertake a baseline survey by May 2010 to determine participation rates among various sections of the society (general, Women, Youth, Persons with disabilities and Minorities) and ascertain factors influencing participation in order to formulate appropriate strategies to enhance their participation in the electoral process. Although this survey was scheduled for completion in May 2010, it is still in progress and only Field work has been completed.

The ECP was also scheduled to develop a Civic and Voter Education Strategy in consultation with CSOs by December 2011 but even this work is in progress as of January 2012. The ECP plans to implement the Civic Education Strategy by December 2012.

The ECP also aims at increasing the turn-out of female voters, minorities, voters with disabilities through voter education.

It is also intended by the ECP to include voter education in the Pakistan Studies curricula at the secondary school and intermediate level by June 2013. No progress has been made as yet on this objective.

The ECP plans to develop and launch Youth-specific awareness campaigns by June 2013 but no specific action has been taken to achieve this objective so far.

Only two out of ten objectives under this goal were to be

realized by this date. The remaining eight objectives have deadlines towards the end of 2012 or middle of 2013.

It is estimated that progress for the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is **65 %**.

Progress on objectives scheduled to be completed after December 31, 2011 is estimated at **1 %** with an overall progress on the Goal estimated at **66 %**.

**Goal 14: Improving the participation of Marginalised Groups including Women, Minorities and Persons with Disabilities in the Electoral Process**

The ECP was to support the adoption of legislation on participation of persons with disabilities by December 2011. No such legislation has been initiated so far but names of transgenders have been included in the Electoral Rolls on the direction of the Supreme Court.

The ECP was to develop and implement policies and procedures for enhancing the registration and electoral participation of women by December 2010. No such special policies or procedures have been developed or implemented so far. In many by elections especially in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa women were kept away from voting by agreement among various political parties. No improvement appears in sight on this objective so far.

The progress on achieving the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is assessed to be **12 %**.

**Goal 15: Enhancing the Participation of Voters and improving the Civic and Voter Education**

Under this goal, the ECP was to develop by December 2010 a distinct uniform design for the divisional and district office buildings along with signboards that could be replicated all across the country. No tangible progress has so far been made on this objective.

The ECP was also to develop an ECP branding using specific colour combinations for all items it uses by December 2010. It is reported that some new designs are developed which are under consideration by the ECP.

The ECP plans to develop and launch a media campaign around the vision and mission of the ECP by December 2014.

In a way, this work has started with the launch of the ECP

Strategic Plan. The ECP anticipates a more aggressive campaign following the successful completion of new Electoral Rolls.

The progress on achieving the objectives scheduled for completion by December 31, 2011 under this Goal is assessed to be **5 %**. However **30 %** progress is assessed to have been made on the objectives which are scheduled for completion after December 31, 2011. Total Progress made for this Goal is estimated at **35%**.

## An Overview of the Progress on the Implementation of the Strategic Plan

There are a total of 129 objectives which are to be realized under 15 Strategic Goals of the ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan.

Out of these, 7 Objectives do not have any specific deadline as these are continuous or regular or recurrent activities.

Out of the remaining 122 Objectives, **76 or 62 %** objectives were scheduled to be achieved by December 31, 2011. The remaining 46 or 38 % objectives are scheduled to be achieved after December 31, 2011 - some of them as late as December 2014.

*Appendix A: Breakdown of ECP Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives* provides all relevant statistical details about how 129 objectives are divided up among the 15 Strategic Goals. *Appendix B: Goal-wise Progress Summary of ECP Strategic Plan* presents summary of the estimated progress for each Goal.

We have tried to assess the progress for each objective individually. We have discussed the objectives' progress with more than one knowledgeable expert outside PILDAT and where possible we have provided an opportunity to the ECP to give us a feedback on the assessment of the percentage of Progress made by us. We have tried to modify our estimate of percentage progress made on individual objectives in case we received a feedback which warranted this modification. *Appendix C: Objectives-wise progress on implementation of ECP Strategic Plan* presents not only the progress but a brief account of the progress made which formed the basis of the assessment of percentage progress.

As of December 31, 2011, the average progress made on 76 objectives which were scheduled to be completed by December 31, 2011 is assessed to be **36 %**, whereas this progress should have been 100 %.

This is not a satisfactory performance but realizing the odds which all these objectives were up against and realizing that this Strategic Plan was first effort of its kind, some element of realism must weigh in before one reaches a final conclusion on this performance.

However one hopes that this assessment will prove to be a shot in the arm and the efforts to achieve progress as per

the Strategic Plan will be expedited.

There has been some progress on some of the 46 objectives whose realization is not yet due. The average progress made on 46 objectives is assessed to be **12 %**.

The total progress made on all 122 objectives as of December 31, 2011 is estimated to be **48 %** (36 % + 12 %).

Out of all the Strategic Goals, the **greatest progress (75 %)** seems to have been made on *Goal 2: Registration of Votes and Electoral Rolls*. This is rather ironic in view of the fact that delay in completion of the Electoral Rolls has prompted the Honourable Supreme Court to make some adverse remarks about the competence and efficiency of the ECP. The Supreme Court has directed the ECP to complete the Electoral Rolls by February 23, 2012 instead of May 27, 2012 as now scheduled by the ECP.

The second greatest progress is made on *Strategic Goal 13: Civic and Voter Education (66 %)*.

The least progress has been made on *Strategic Goal 14: Marginalised Groups* where only **12 %** progress is estimated.

*Appendix B: Goal-wise Progress Summary of ECP Strategic Plan* presents estimated progress for each Goal under two separate heads i.e for the objectives scheduled to be realized by December 31 and for the objectives scheduled to be achieved after December 31, 2011.

## Major Issues regarding Electoral Reforms which emerged or were discussed during the past quarter

Following are some of the major issues relating to Electoral Reforms which came up for repeated discussion or comments during the quarter starting from September 26, 2011 to December 31, 2011.

### Electoral Rolls

Electoral Rolls remained the most important electoral issue during the past 3 months. The ECP continued door-to-door verification of the Draft Electoral Rolls (DERs). The DERs were earlier produced by the NADRA on March 8, 2011 using its database of adult population of Pakistan. The NADRA claimed that its database covered 95 % of the adult (18 years and above) population of Pakistan. Many people complained that the ECP enumerators did not visit their house for verification. In any case, the verification exercise which continued for 86 days from August 22, 2011 to November 15, 2011, collected a huge number of modifications (14 Million, as reported by NADRA) to the draft rolls. This collected data was shared with the NADRA on November 24, 2011 so that these modifications are incorporated in the draft electoral rolls and Preliminary Electoral Rolls (PERs) are generated for formal display for 21 days for inviting public comments.

In the meanwhile, while hearing a petition filed by the PTI Chief Imran Khan, a three-member bench of the Supreme Court headed by the Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan, Mr. Iftikhar Chaudhry, directed the ECP on December 21, 2011 to complete the Electoral Rolls by February 23, 2012. The ECP reportedly expressed its inability to meet the Supreme Court deadline but the Supreme Court rejected the ECP reasons and insisted that the Electoral Rolls should be completed by February 23, 2012.

The Supreme Court also took exception to non-revision of Electoral Rolls annually during the past 4 years contrary to the requirement of the Constitution and law.

Earlier, the ECP Secretary had addressed a press conference on March 8, 2011 highlighting the flaws of the existing electoral rolls and presented the findings documented through verification of the rolls by the NADRA against its database. The ECP Secretary termed the NADRA report as containing '*startling revelations*' and that the NADRA exercise confirmed *genuineness of the*

*complaints regarding the errors*, multiple and bogus entries in the electoral rolls 2007.

The NADRA report and its high-profile dissemination by the ECP Secretary totally destroyed the credibility of the Electoral Rolls 2007 and many political leaders including the PTI Chief Imran Khan called the legitimacy of the current Parliament and Provincial Assemblies into question because these were elected on the basis of electoral rolls-2007 which were now confirmed to have 46 % invalid entries.

This rather sad state of the credibility of the current electoral rolls added an element of urgency to the need to have new, accurate, up-to-date and credible electoral rolls as early as possible because the next election may be called sooner than the latest possible date of May 2013 for National Assembly.

### Annual Statements of Assets and Liabilities submitted by national and provincial legislators

The ECP suspended the membership of 231 national and provincial legislators on October 21, 2011 when they failed to submit statements of their assets and liabilities within the stipulated period as per law.

These legislators included 13 Senators, 103 members of the National Assembly, 58 members of Punjab Assembly, 23 members of the Sindh Assembly, 28 MPAs of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Assembly and 6 MPAs from the Balochistan Assembly.

This is almost an annual routine that the ECP suspends all those legislators who fail to submit their statements by October 15. This year the number of defaulting legislators was higher than usual. As these legislators submitted their statements after their membership was suspended, their memberships were gradually restored.

Out of total 1170 legislators, 936 had submitted their statements of Assets and Liabilities, while three seats, including one National Assembly and two Punjab Assembly seats were vacant.

According to Sub-Section (1) of Section 42A of the Representation of the People Act 1976, every member should submit a statement of assets and liabilities of his own, his spouse and dependent annually to the



Commission by September 30, each year.

Sub-section (3) of Section 42A further reads that the Commission shall, by October 15 each year, notify the names of the members, who fail to file statements of assets and liabilities within the period specified in Sub-section (1) thereof and by an order, direct that such member shall cease to function till such statement is submitted.

Prominent among those legislators whose membership had been suspended included: *Senator Dr. Asim Hussain*, (Sindh, PPPP), Federal Minister for Petroleum, *Senator Dr. Abdul Hafiz Shaikh*, (Sindh, PPPP) Federal Minister of Finance, *Senator Rehman Malik*, (Punjab, PPPP), Federal Minister of Interior, *Chaudhry Amed Mukhtar*, MNA (NA-105, Gujrat-II, Punjab, PPPP), Minister of Defence, *Mian Riaz Pirzada*, MNA (NA-186, Bhawalpur-IV, Punjab, PML), Federal Minister for Professional and Technical Training, *Makhdoom Muhammad Amin Fahim*, MNA (NA-218, Hyderabad-I, Sindh, PPPP), Federal Minister of Commerce, *Syed Naveed Qamar*, MNA (NA-222, Hyderabad-V, Sindh, PPPP) Federal Minister for Water and Power, *Dr. Arbab Ghulam Rahim*, MPA (PS-60, Tharrparkar-I, PPPP), *Khawaja Muhammad Asif*, MNA (NA-110, Sialkot-I, Punjab, PML-N), *Sardar Awais Ahmed Khan Leghari*, MNA (NA-172, D.G. Khan-II, Punjab, PML), *Mr. Jamshed Dasti*, MNA (NA-178, Muzaffargarh-III, Punjab, PPPP), *Sardar Nabil Ahmed Gabol*, MNA (NA-248, Karachi-X, Sindh, PPPP), *Syed Ahmed Mujtaba Gilani*, MPA (PP-206, Multan-XIII, PPPP), *Senator Muhammad Ali Durrani* (Punjab, PML), *Senator Pervaiz Rashid* (Punjab, PML-N), *Syed Abdur Qadir Gilani*, MPA (PP-295, Rahimyar Khan-XI, PPPP) and *Ms. Nargis Faiz Malik*, MPA (W-328, Reserved Seat, PPPP), etc.

The suspension of so many senior ministers and prominent legislators raised a number of questions and a lively debate continued in the media for many days. Some of the key questions raised were as follows:

- i. *Why so many legislators fail to fulfill a routine responsibility and does this reflect on their sense of responsibility?*
- ii. *How accurate are the statements of assets and liabilities?*
- iii. *Why can't the statements be made accessible to media and general public as per the spirit of the law which requires that these statements be published in the Gazette of the Government of Pakistan? The Gazette of these statements is generally published*

with a delay of about 6 to 8 months and it is a very complicated process to obtain a copy of the gazette. The ECP has been repeatedly requested to upload the statements on the ECP website but so far the ECP has not been able to comply. Despite the fact that the ECP included an objective in the 5-year Strategic Plan (Goal 12: Political Parties and Candidates; Objective No. 3: 'Publish the financial statements of parliamentarians and political parties on the ECP Website' and set a deadline of October 2010 for achieving this objective, the ECP has so far not taken this rather simple step for greater transparency.

- iv. *Doesn't ECP need more powers and a greater capacity to verify the submitted statements rather than acting simply as a post office?*
- v. *Doesn't the prevalent format for submission of statements of assets and liabilities require improvement? For example there is no uniform basis or criteria for indicating the present value of the assets; a criteria needs to be evolved and format made simpler.*
- vi. *Shouldn't the annual statements of assets and liabilities of other public officials such as the Civil servants, Military Officials and Judges be made public like those of legislators? Why can't the Parliament legislate to this effect? It is worth mentioning that according to the Charter of Democracy signed by the Pakistan Peoples Party and the Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz, and as contained in both these parties' Election 2008 Manifestoes, both parties had pledged that "All Military and Judicial Officers to file annual statements of wealth and Income." No legislation has been passed in this regard in the Parliament as of December 2011 which makes it binding for Military and Judiciary to file annual statements of assets that can be made publicly available. Not only that the PPP, leading the current ruling coalition did not take an initiative, the largest opposition party, PML-N, members have also not moved a private member's bill in this regard.*

## Political Finance

The ECP, to its credit, raised the question of political finance and the need for introducing reforms in this context.

On November 7, 2011, the ECP announced that it was establishing a 'Political Finance Wing' as a first step to eliminate corruption from politics. The ECP has been

working on this vital reform for the past many months and **Goal 12 of the Strategic Plan** sets two specific objectives in this regard.

Objective 1 is about a legislation on Political Finance and Objective 2 is about regulations and procedures to implement legislation on political finance. Both these objectives were to be realized by December 2011 but apparently no tangible progress has been made in this regard though there had been media reports and comments during this quarter.

As we approach the election and the question will be increasingly asked about spending huge sums of money on elections both by parties and individual candidates far in excess of the ceiling fixed by the law and ECP's inability to check these excesses in the past.

A credible and effective system needs to be in place well before the next election at least to check the excessive election spending.

## Major Election-related Issues expected to dominate political scene in the near future

### Electoral Rolls and deadline set by the Supreme Court

The Supreme Court has taken a very strict view of the delay in the preparation of fresh Electoral Rolls.

The ECP had fixed a target of December 31, 2011 for completing the final computerized electoral rolls in its strategic plan and had repeatedly reiterated the deadline in various communications and occasions during 2010 and up to the middle of 2011. Later the ECP fixed March, then April and lately May 2012 for the completion of Electoral Rolls.

The ECP has its reasons for this delay and mainly it was attributed to the increase in the number of Census Blocks by the Census Organization which increased NADRA work load, severe rain and floods in Sindh and Punjab and adverse law and order situation in the KP and Balochistan which did not allow the completion of door-to-door verification of draft electoral rolls in time.

The Supreme Court has refused to accept these reasons and has insisted that the final computerized electoral rolls should be complete by **February 23, 2012**.

The ability of the ECP and the NADRA to be able to meet the Supreme Court deadline is a subject of debate and the subject will continue to dominate the electoral scene in the next few months.

### The Date of the next General Election

When will the next general election take place? The question is expected to be the subject of intense speculation during the next quarter and beyond.

According to the Constitution, the current National Assembly has a term of 5 years unless the Prime Minister dissolves the Assembly anytime earlier than that and calls for fresh election. In case the Assembly completes its 5 year term which is due for completion on March 16, 2013, the election has to be held within 60 days from the date it completes the term. This sets the latest date of May 14, 2013 for National Assembly Election.

The four Provincial Assemblies also have 5 year terms and

since each one of them had its first sitting on a different date a few days apart from one another, Constitutionally their terms would expire on different dates and hence technically their elections can take place on different dates but there has been a convention to hold national and provincial assemblies election on the same day, it is expected that May 14, 2013 is the latest when Provincial Assemblies can also hold elections.

There is an increasing speculation that the Prime Minister may advise the dissolution of the National Assembly soon after the Senate election in March 2012. As required by the Constitution, the election should take place within 90 days of the dissolution of the Assembly. In case this happens, it is largely believed that the four provincial Chief Ministers will also follow suit so that the Provincial Assemblies election may also be held on the same date as that of the National Assembly.

### Election in the presence of a partisan President and partisan Provincial Governors

At least two mainstream political parties, the PML-N and the PTI have publically expressed serious doubts about the integrity of the next election if held while Mr. Asif Ali Zardari is the President of Pakistan. This is mainly because Mr. Zardari is also the Co-Chairman and a de facto chairman of the ruling Pakistan Peoples Party. These parties feel that election can not be held on a level playing field in the presence of a partisan President.

Although election is to be conducted by the ECP and not the government or President but the governments and Presidents have influenced the results of the elections in the past and therefore some parties are apprehensive of the continuation of the President during the election period.

Similar concerns may also be expressed about most, if not all, of the Provincial Governors. The current Provincial Governor in Punjab is a staunch PPP person; the Sindh Governor belongs to the MQM; Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Governor is an old guard PPP person. The Balochistan Governor is relatively a non-active partisan and therefore may not be the subject of intense criticism. Rest of the three governors will definitely become the subject of intense debate in the coming months in the context of the credibility of coming election.

This debate about the possible influence of the President and the Provincial Governors can lose its steam if credible

and truly neutral caretaker governments are appointed at the centre and in the provinces after reaching a consensus with the opposition parties and if a new Chief Election Commissioner is appointed through a bi-partisan consensus.

### **The Federal and Provincial Care-taker Governments and their 'Neutrality'**

The 18th Constitutional Amendment amended the process of formation of Caretaker Cabinets before General Election.

The amendment states that after dissolution of the Assembly the President shall appoint a Caretaker Prime Minister in consultation with the out-going Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly.

The provision of Consultation for the formation of a Caretaker Government is provided under Article 224 of the Constitution amended in the 18th Constitutional Amendment passed by the Parliament in April 2010:

Article 224 states that:

*"[(1A) On dissolution of the Assembly on completion of its term, or in case it is dissolved under Article 58 or Article 112, the President, or the Governor, as the case may be, shall appoint a care-taker Cabinet:*

*Provided that the care-taker Prime Minister shall be selected by the President in consultation with the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the outgoing National Assembly, and a care-taker Chief Minister shall be appointed by the Governor in consultation with the Chief Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the outgoing Provincial Assembly:*

*Provided further that the Members of the Federal and Provincial care-taker Cabinets shall be appointed on the advice of the care-taker Prime Minister or the care-taker Chief Minister, as the case may be."*

However, there is no definition of the word 'consultation' in the Constitution.

Serious disputes had arisen in connection with the interpretation of the word 'Consultation' with regard to the

appointment of Chairman NAB between the President and the Leader of the Opposition. While the President has maintained that he had sought the views of the Leader of the Opposition through a letter and though Leader of the Opposition did not agree with the President, the act of consultation was accomplished and the requirement of the law was fulfilled. The Leader of the Opposition feels that the consultation should be consensus oriented. Leader of the Opposition has challenged the appointment of the current Chairman NAB on the grounds that real consultation did not take place. According to the National Accountability Ordinance (XVIII of 1999) (as modified on March 26, 2010), chairman of the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) is to be appointed by the President *in consultation* with the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly of Pakistan. The law states that:

In legal parlance, one way of defining "Consultation" is as defined by the Supreme Court of Pakistan in the Al Jihad Trust case 1996. The words 'after consultation with the Chief Justice' in Articles 177 (1), 193 (1) and 203-C (4) of the Constitution have been interpreted by the Supreme Court in Al-Jihad Trust vs Federation of Pakistan, PLD 1996 SC 324 as follows:

*"consultation should be effective, meaningful, purposive, consensus-oriented, leaving no room for complaint or arbitrariness or unfair play."*

In this political scenario, the appointment of an independent and non-partisan caretaker government is crucial for overseeing the conduct of a free and fair election in Pakistan. However the precedent of "consultation" set by the President on the appointment of NAB Chief raises legitimate doubts on these prospects.

If consultation takes place in its true spirit and truly neutral care-taker governments are appointed after bi-partisan consensus, most, if not all, doubts regarding the partisan President and the Governors may be largely neutralized because in the present scheme of government, executive authority resides with the Prime minister and Chief Ministers and not with the President or Governors.

PILDAT, as an independent political think tank of Pakistan, has filed a Constitution Petition before the Supreme Court asking the Court to interpret the scope of 'Consultation' between the President and the outgoing Leader of the House and the Leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly for the formation of Caretaker Governments

during the next General Election. Since the “neutrality” of the Caretaker Governments is essential for holding a free and fair election in Pakistan, PILDAT felt that this situation may also arise at the time of General Election if the President and the Leader of the Opposition do not agree on the name of a Caretaker Prime Minister. Similar situation may also arise in the provinces.

It is anticipated that the make-up of the Care-taker governments and the scope of 'Consultation' as used in the Constitution in that context will be a subject of great interest and discussion in the Parliament, Provincial Assemblies, court rooms and in the media.

### **Appointment of the new Chief Election Commissioner (CEC)**

The current CEC is due for retirement in March 2012.

The appointment of a new CEC which is acceptable to both the Government and the Opposition is crucial for the credibility of the ECP and the coming election. As the confrontation between the major ruling party PPP and the main opposition party the PML-N has intensified in the recent weeks, reaching a consensus on the appointment of the CEC may have become more difficult than it was a few months ago when the four members of the ECP were appointed amicably through a bi-partisan consensus.

Since a bi-partisan Parliamentary committee plays a crucial role in the appointment of CEC and members of the Election Commission, a party that is not currently represented in the Parliament will have no role in the consultation process. Lately the PTI of Imran Khan seems to have gained a significant public support as demonstrated in the huge public rallies in different cities of the country but it has no representation in the Parliament as the party had boycotted the last election in 2008. Will the parliamentary leadership be mature enough to take Imran Khan's party on board too when deciding about the next CEC?

The critical subject of the appointment of the next CEC is expected to figure prominently in the next few months.

### **The Term of current members of the Election Commission**

The term of the next CEC has been fixed as 5 years as per the 18th Constitutional amendment but the amendment left

the question of the term of the ECP members open.

Logically their terms should also be the same as that of the CEC as is the case in many countries such as India, Bangladesh and Sri Lanka but the Government has introduced a bill in the Parliament proposing to fix this term as 2 years. This subject will also be intensely debated both within and outside the Parliament in the days to come.

### **Inability of the Government to conduct new Population Census despite a lapse of four years and the use of new Census Blocks by the ECP in revised Electoral Rolls**

The latest population census in Pakistan was held in 1998 and the next such census was due after 10 years in 2008.

The number of National Assembly seats allocated to a province and allocation of financial resources to the provinces from the federal divisible pool depend among many such decisions on the latest census. Delimitation of National and Provincial Assemblies constituencies is also undertaken by the ECP in the light of the new Census.

Unfortunately the new Population Census could not take place so far although the Census Organization managed to undertake a Housing Census during 2011 in preparation for the Population Census. The number of Census Blocks was 102,295 as per the last census held in 1998. The Census organization has increased the number of census blocks to 139,872 during the Housing Census. This 37 % increase in the number of census blocks was not uniform across the country and did not even roughly correspond to the percentage increase in the number of voters.

Some provinces especially Sindh showed very high percentage increase (67 %) in the number of census blocks while others showed much less increase (Balochistan 10 %, KP 29 % and Punjab 31 %). This discrepancy in the percentage increase in the census blocks and registered votes in cities was even more pronounced. For example Karachi registered an increase of 3 % in registered voters according to the Draft Electoral Rolls but its Census Blocks increased 81 %. Hyderabad City registered a decline in the number of voters by 18 % but its census blocks increased by 91 %.

This disproportionate increase could not be satisfactorily explained by the Census Organization or ECP in their meetings with the political parties. The ECP has

incorporated the increased number of Census Blocks as Electoral Areas in its revised under-preparation Electoral Rolls.

At least one political party, the PML-N, has raised serious objections to the use of new electoral rolls in the revised electoral rolls as according to PML-N, the new census blocks have not been endorsed by the Council of Common Interests (CCI) and that disproportionate increase in census blocks in some areas can be used as a basis for acceptance of greater increase in population in the next census leading to serious ramifications for number of National Assembly seats and allocation of resources under NFC.

The subject may be raised in the days to come when the revised Preliminary Electoral Rolls will be displayed for inviting objections.



# APPENDICES





## Appendix A

## Breakdown of ECP Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives

Goal No.	Goal Title	Number of Objectives with Specific Deadline			Number of Objectives without any specific deadline	Total Number of Objectives
		Number of Objectives scheduled to be completed BY Dec 31 2011	Number of Objectives scheduled to be completed AFTER Dec 31, 2011	Total Number of Objectives with specific deadline		
1	Legal Framework	3	0	3	1	4
2	Electoral Rolls	11	0	11	1	12
3	Election Operations	11	5	16	3	19
4	Complaints & Disputes Resolution	2	2	4	0	4
5	Restructuring ECP	7	0	7	0	7
6	Logistics, Infrastructure, Equipment	5	6	11	0	11
7	Human Resources	8	3	11	2	13
8	Finance & Budget	3	1	4	0	4
9	Training, Research & Evaluation	5	12	17	0	17
10	IT	6	2	8	0	8
11	Public Outreach	1	4	5	0	5
12	Political Parties & Candidates	5	1	6	0	6
13	Civic & Voter Education	2	8	10	0	10
14	Marginalised Groups	5	1	6	0	6
15	Branding	2	1	3	0	3
	<b>Total</b>	<b>76</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>122</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>129</b>

## Appendix B

## Goal-wise Progress Summary of ECP Strategic Plan - As of December 31, 2011

Goal	Goal Title	Progress made on Objectives Scheduled to be completed <b>BY</b> December 31, 2011	Progress made on Objectives scheduled to be completed <b>AFTER</b> December 31, 2011	Total Progress for the Goal
1	Legal Framework	33%	0%	33%
2	Electoral Rolls	75%	0%	75%
3	Election Operations	16%	22%	38%
4	Complaints & Disputes Resolution	25%	20%	45%
5	Restructuring ECP	42%	0%	42%
6	Logistics, Infrastructure, Equipment	26%	0%	26%
7	Human Resources	45%	3%	48%
8	Finance & Budget	8%	20%	28%
9	Training, Research & Evaluation	42%	18%	60%
10	IT	41%	20%	61%
11	Public Outreach	0%	25%	25%
12	Political Parties & Candidates	20%	0%	20%
13	Civic & Voter Education	65%	1%	66%
14	Marginalised Groups	12%	0%	12%
15	Branding	5%	30%	35%
<b>Overall Progress for 15 Goals</b>		<b>36%</b>	<b>12%</b>	<b>48%</b>

## Appendix C

## Objectives-wise Progress on Implementation of ECP Strategic Plan

Strategic Goal	Objectives with Deadline <b>BY</b> Dec 31, 2011		Objectives with Deadline <b>AFTER</b> Dec 31, 2011		Overall Progress	
	Number and Title of Objectives	Progress as of Dec 31, 2011	Number and Title of Objectives	Progress as of Dec 31, 2011		
<b>1: Legal Framework</b>	1. Revise legal framework	50%			50%	
	2. Unification of Election Laws	50%			50%	
	3. Enhance public understanding of election laws thru Urdu translation	0%			0%	
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>33%</b>			<b>33%</b>	
<b>2. Electoral Rolls</b>	1. Improve existing CERS	50%			50%	
	2. Agreement with NADRA	100%			100%	
	3. Pilot project for ECP-NADRA collaboration	100%			100%	
	4. Verify Electoral Rolls with NADRA database	50%			50%	
	5. Legislation on mandatory CNIC	100%			100%	
	6. ECP Infrastructure for maintaining Voters Data	75%			75%	
	7. Study on female Enumerators	100%			100%	
	8. Simplify voters registration forms	100%			100%	
	9. Study on picture in electoral roll	100%			100%	
	10. Improve display of draft rolls	50%			50%	
	11. Extend CERS to all Country	0%			0%	
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>75%</b>			<b>75%</b>	
<b>3. Election Operations</b>	1. Identify new buildings for polling stations	10%	8. Increase number of polling stations	0%	10%	
	2. Recruitment & Hiring System for temporary staff	10%	10. Efficient Results Management System	10%	20%	
	3. Establish Polling Staff Database	0%	11. publish polling station-wise results on ECP website	0%	0%	
	4. EVM Study	100%	15. Enhance access to Election Observers	30%	130%	
	5. Establish permanent polling stations	10%	17. Review Election symbols	70%	80%	
	6. Explore CCTV monitoring	0%			0%	
	7. Linkage between polling stations and electoral rolls	10%			10%	
	9. Simplify election related forms	10%			10%	
	12. Review guidelines for polling agents	0%			0%	
	13. Examine postal ballot System	0%			0%	
	14. Booklet for candidates	30%			30%	
	<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>16%</b>	<b>22%</b>		<b>38%</b>

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

4. Election Complaints & Disputes Resolution	1. Designate officer to deal with Pre-Poll complaints.	0%	3. Establish Complaint Management Committees	10%	10%
	2. Ensure appropriate legislation for electoral disputes resolution system	50%	4. Put in place a complaint tracking system	30%	80%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>25%</b>		<b>20%</b>	<b>45%</b>
5. Restructuring the ECP	1. Develop and approve the re-organization plan	90%			90%
	2. Organizational restructuring of the ECP	20%			20%
	3. Establish a Legal Unit headed by a Deputy Secretary.	50%			50%
	4. Establish a Training, Research and Evaluation Wing.	75%			75%
	5. Update DG IT to BS 20.	0%			0%
	6. Establish an Electoral Rolls Unit.	10%			10%
	7. Strengthen the Federal Election Academy	50%			50%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>42%</b>			<b>42%</b>
6. Logistics, Infrastructure and Equipment for ECP	1. Conduct a comprehensive need assesment of ECP infrastructure.	50%	2. Construct/Purchase ECP buildings for Field Offices	0%	50%
	7. Replace/purchase vehicles for District offices	50%	3. Construct Housing for ECP staff	0%	50%
	8. Purchase Computers, scanners, printers furniture etc	30%	4. Construct ECP warehouses for Election Material	0%	30%
	10. Review and maintain computer based inventory of Election Supplies.	0%	5. Construct building for ECP Federal Election Academy	0%	0%
	11. Adopt a policy for engaging private vehicles for elections	0%	6. Construct additional space for Court Room at ECP Secretariat.	0%	0%
			9. Develop logistics plan for conducting elections	0%	0%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>26%</b>		<b>0%</b>	<b>26%</b>

7. Human Resources Compensation	1. Develop a comprehensive HR policy	75%	7.Ensure that eligible women have atleast 10% representation in the ECP jobs.	10%	85%
	2.Review and update HR rules.	50%	8.Ensure that eligible persons with disabilities have atleast 2% representation in the ECP jobs	0%	50%
	3.Prepare TOR/Job Descriptions of each position	75%	9.Ensure that eligible minorities have atleast 5 % representation in ECP jobs.	0%	75%
	4.Establish policy for initial appointment of officers in BPS-17	50%			50%
	5.Increase pay structures	0%			0%
	6. Review the existing promotion policy	30%			30%
	10.Create a pool of former and serving ? officers.	30%			30%
	11.Prepare the ECP officers for the role of DROS, Ros	50%			50%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>45%</b>		<b>3%</b>	<b>48%</b>
8. Finance and Budget	1. Ensure Complete financial autonomy.	25%	3.Raise funds for the implementation of the ECP strategic Plan.	20%	45%
	2.Computerized the Budget Wing	0%			0%
	4.Asses and strengthen the current procurment policy	0%			0%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>8%</b>		<b>20%</b>	<b>28%</b>

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

9. Training, Research and Evaluation	1. Strengthen the Federal Election Academy to make it a model training institution.	50%	2. Build Capacity for all employees through training.	30%	80%
	4. Develop curricula for various training programmes.	50%	3. Conduct Specific workshops for various officials.	30%	80%
	5. Conduct BRIDGE Training for ECP officials	50%	6. Conduct Research on contemporary electoral issues	20%	70%
	9. Develop a pool of resource persons for FEA.	30%	7. Undertake Election-related Study Visits	50%	80%
	14. Specialized IT training	30%	8. Monitor and evaluate all programmes and projects.	30%	60%
			10. Train polling officers.	10%	10%
			11. Train political party agents.	0%	0%
			12. Conduct trainings/briefings for election observers.	0%	0%
			13. Conduct training of Security Personnel.	0%	0%
			15. Conduct IT trainings in country-wide offices.	10%	10%
			16. Coordinate with Donor agencies.	30%	30%
		17. Coordinate with Training Wing of the Establishment Division.	0%	0%	
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>42%</b>		<b>18%</b>	<b>60%</b>
10. Information Technology	1. Formulate a comprehensive IT policy.	50%	3. Extend the ECP Intranet portal facility.	30%	80%
	2. Strengthen the IT infrastructure at ECP.	30%	7. Introduce a geographical information system.	10%	40%
	4. Re-Design the ECP website	75%			75%
	5. Restructuring the IT directorate.	30%			30%
	6. Establish computerized electoral rolls data centre.	50%			50%
	8. Develop and Implement comprehensive information security and private policy.	10%			10%
	<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>41%</b>		<b>20%</b>

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

11. Public Outreach and Interaction.	4. Establish a permanent Media Centre at the ECP.	0%	1. Increase the level of Interaction with Political Parties.	50%	50%
			2. Hold regular consultations with political parties and civil society organization.	30%	30%
			3. Develop and implement media outreach policy and strategy.	0%	0%
			5. Publish and ECP quarterly newsletter.	20%	20%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>0%</b>		<b>25%</b>	<b>25%</b>
12. Political Parties and Candidates	1. Reform Legislation on Political finance	20%	5. Train political party reps & candidates on electoral rolls	0%	20%
	2. Develop regulations and mechanisms.	20%			20%
	3. Publish the financial statements of Parliamentarians on ECP Website.	0%			0%
	4. Strengthen Code of Conduct for parties/ candidates.	30%			30%
	6. Make changes in statement of assets & liabilities Form	30%			30%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>20%</b>		<b>0%</b>	<b>20%</b>
13. Civic and Voter Education.	1. Conduct a baseline survey to determine participation rates of various segments of society	80%	3. Implement civic and voter education strategy.	10%	90%
	2. Develop civic and voter education strategy.	50%	4. Increase the % of voter turnout from 44 to 63 %.	0%	50%
			5. Increase the turnout of female voters.	0%	0%
			6. Increase the turnout of minority voters.	0%	0%
			7. Increase the turnout of persons with disabilities	0%	0%
			8. Minimize election violence thru voter education	0%	0%
			9. Include voter education in schools ? curricula	0%	0%
			10. Develop youth-specific awareness campaigns.	0%	0%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>65%</b>		<b>1%</b>	<b>66%</b>



## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

14. Marginalized Groups	1. Support legislation on participation of disabled.	0%	3. Develop awareness materials for participation of the marginalised.	0%	0%
	2. Conduct research on voting participation of disabled	0%			0%
	4. Conduct research on voting participation of women	10%			10%
	5. Develop and implement policies to increase electoral participation of women & marginalised groups	0%			0%
	6. Train ECP officials re participation of disabled ? voters.	50%			50%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>12%</b>		<b>0%</b>	<b>12%</b>
15. Branding of the ECP	1. Develop a design for Divisional & District Office Buildings	0%	2. Develop and Launch Media Campaign around the vision & Mission of ECP	30%	30%
	3. Develop an ECP branding.	10%			10%
<b>Overall Goal Progress</b>		<b>5%</b>		<b>30%</b>	<b>35%</b>
<b>Total Objectives</b>	<b>76</b>		<b>46</b>		
<b>Overall Progress</b>		<b>36%</b>		<b>12%</b>	<b>48%</b>

## Appendix D

## Computerised Electoral Rolls Time Line

July 10, 2008	Kanwar Muhammad. Dilshad, the Secretary, ECP presided over a meeting and said that the state of the art IT infrastructure, which is being procured by ECP through IFES on behalf of USAID for computerization of Electoral System will provide a solid foundation for successful implementation and operationalization of Computerized Electoral Rolls System (CERS).
April 7, 2009	Kanwar Dilshad, Secretary ECP, announced that the CEC has directed the commencement of annual revision of electoral rolls through door-to-door verification of existing rolls throughout the country.
March 29, 2010	Civil Society Organizations supported the proposal to make CNIC a pre-requisite of registration of voters and casting of vote in a consultative session organized by ECP.
March 30, 2010	Political parties supported the proposal to make CNIC a pre-requisite of registration of voters and casting of vote in a consultative session organized by ECP.
October 12, 2010	ECP launched pilot project for new computerized electoral rolls through collaboration with NADRA in 15 electoral areas in each of the four districts i.e Vehari (Punjab), Karachi East (Sindh), Swabi (KP), Quetta (Balochistan). The pilot was scheduled to complete by 24 October 2010.
December 29, 2010	ECP sent a draft bill to Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs proposing CNIC as the pre-requisite for registration as a voter and for casting the vote.
February 2, 2011	CEC announced that door to door enumeration for fresh computerized Electoral Rolls would start from May 2011.
February 3, 2011	CEC announced that ECP would prepare Electoral Rolls-2011 in collaboration with NADRA based on new Census blocks. He announced that ECP would share the existing rolls data with NADRA which would complete the first phase of preparation of rolls by March 2011 by preparing the first draft of the rolls after verification and augmentation of the rolls in the light of the NADRA database. Chairman NADRA, Ali Arshad Hakeem informed that over 93% population has so far been registered alongwith their photographs and thumb impressions
February 15, 2011	CEC announced that ECP would prepare Electoral Rolls-2011 till 31 December 2011. Asif Bajwa, Secretary Statistics Division informed that soft copy of the new census blocks would not be available before June 2011. It was therefore decided by the meeting presided over by the CEC to launch actual enumeration in the first week of June 2011. NADRA Chairman assured that the whole work of fresh electoral rolls would be completed by 31 December 2011 despite the delay in starting the enumeration.
February 18, 2011	ECP Database of Electoral Rolls-2007 was provided to NADRA for verification and augmentation.
February 22, 2011	Political parties supported the proposal to make CNIC a pre-requisite of registration of voters and casting of vote in a consultative session organized by ECP.
March 4, 2011	A third high level meeting of the ECP and USAID was held in Islamabad under the chairmanship of Secretary ECP. Secretary ECP thanked USAID for its assistance and said that ECP would move a summary to the PM for a grant of Rs. 2 B less US \$ 8.5 M committed by USAID. ECP and USAID would sign a MOU soon. Secretary ECP reiterated that the whole process of electoral rolls would be completed by 31 December 2011.

March 8, 2011	<p>ECP Secretary announced the completion of the first phase of preparation of fresh computerized electoral rolls and released the Electoral Rolls data after verification and augmentation by NADRA . The electoral rolls were to be completed in three phases as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Phase 1: Verification and augmentation of 2007 Computerised Electoral Rolls data of ECP by NADRA against NADRA database. (Completed 8 March 2011)</li> <li>ii. Phase 2: Door to door verification of the data provided by NADRA (June-July 2011)</li> <li>iii. Phase 3: Printing of final Computerised Electoral Rolls-2011 (By December 2011) Secretary said that NADRA analysis had 'confirmed genuineness of the complaints that the 2007 electoral rolls contained variances in terms of errors, multiple and bogus entries as was evident from the startling revelations of the report that out of 81.2 M voters registered in 2007 , only 44.02 M have been verified by NADRA and 37.1 M have been Unverified voters. Secretary ECP added that the CEC has directed to expedite the completion of the remaining two phases till December 2011.</li> </ol>
March 30, 2011	<p>ECP all set to prepare CERS on CNIC basis and would prepare CERS-2011 on CNIC basis in collaboration with NADRA according to the new Census Blocks devised by Census Organization. Ground work for preparation of CERS for obtaining data about new census blocks and house-heads will start, parallel to the house-listing by the Census Organization, from 5th April 2011, and need to devise a foolproof system to eliminate any possibility of bogus entries in the electoral rolls. In the first phase of preparation of Computerized Electoral Rolls-2011, the existing Electoral Rolls-2007 data has been shared with NADRA and NADRA has successfully completed verification and augmentation of Electoral Rolls-2007 data. He also said that the preparation of accurate computerized electoral rolls is a demand of all the political parties, civil society, media and the entire nation as it provides a basis for credible, free and fair elections.</p>
March 31, 2011	<p>Supreme Court passed an order directing the ECP to 'fulfill its constitutional commitments as early as could be possible</p>
April 18, 2011	<p>Parliament passes the act making CNIC as a pre-requisite for registering a voter and casting of vote.</p>
April 23, 2011	<p>Secretary ECP said that more than half of work was done for Computerized Electoral rolls and electronic voting machine (EVM), The CEC has thanked all the Parliamentarians, Political Parties, Civil Society and the Media who have fully supported the ECP in its efforts to achieve this objective.</p> <p>Secretary ECP mentioned some of the milestones of this roadmap as under:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i- In the electoral council's meeting held in 2010 it was decided to use the Computerized National Identity Cards (CNIC) as Unique Identifier without which it was not possible to prepare Computerized Electoral Rolls (CERS).</li> <li>ii- As this required amendments in the law, a draft bill making CNIC mandatory was sent by the ECP on 29-12-2010 to Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs which has now (on 18th April, 2011) been passed by the Parliament.</li> <li>iii- Political parties supported the proposal in consultative meetings held with them on 30-3-2010 and 22-2-2011.</li> <li>iv- Likewise, Civil Society recommended the proposals in the meeting held on 29-3-2010.</li> <li>v- In order to determine the feasibility of the proposal in real time environment, a pilot project for preparation of computerized Electoral Rolls was started and completed in four districts, one in each province, in 2010.</li> </ol>

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

April 23, 2011	<p>vi- In a judgment announced on 31-3-2011, the Hon'ble CEC also received blessings and approval of Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan to complete the project "as soon as could be possible".</p> <p>vii- Now, in April 2011, information about house-hold numbers and the CNIC of head of the house-hold has been collected through the enumerators and supervisors engaged by the Population Census organization.</p> <p>viii- The ECP database pertaining to Electoral Rolls-2007 was provided to NADRA on 18th February 2011 which after verification and augmentation was released on 8th March 2011.</p> <p>ix- Instructions have been issued to all Provincial Election Commissioners to complete all the arrangements for door-to-door verification of draft Electoral Rolls in July 2011.</p> <p>x- The ECP will complete this task in December 2011 and the final lists will be given to NADRA for printing so that the same could be used for any future elections Secretary ECP announced that it was half way through in its work on new Electoral Rolls and the EVM and it just needed time and necessary resources for completion of remaining stages by the end of 2011.</p>
May 5, 2011	The Act No. XI of 2011 enacted by the Government of Pakistan making CNIC as a pre-requisite for registering as a voter and for casting the vote.
June 27, 2011	<p>ECP and NADRA signed a contract to use NADRA's citizens CNIC data for verification, updation and augmentation of ECP's existing voters' database using CNIC number as a unique identifier. ECP Secretary announced that door to door verification of over 80 million electors having CNIC would start from 18 July 2011 and continue till 16 August 2011.</p> <p>Secretary, ECP elaborating the detail of contract that NADRA will provide certain other services as well such as:</p> <p>i) Providing prints of draft electoral rolls based on new census block codes;</p> <p>ii) digitization of changes made during door to door verification process;</p> <p>iii) Printing of agreed numbers of sets (copies) of preliminary electoral rolls;</p> <p>iv) Incorporation of changes made during display process and printing of agreed number of copies of final electoral rolls, its binding and distribution.</p>
July 4, 2011	Supreme Court of Pakistan passed an order for the expedited completion of electoral rolls.
July 25, 2011	ECP submits a report to the Supreme Court of Pakistan on the progress on preparing new electoral rolls.
August 2011	NADRA produced Draft Electoral Rolls (DER) based on the information of new Census Blocks provided by the officials of the Pakistan Census organization (PCO)
September 10, 2011	ECP secretary announced that the 4th consultative meeting with political parties to share progress on revision of Electoral Rolls-2011 would be held on September 13, 2011.
September 19, 2011	ECP took various decisions after meeting a delegation of FATA parliamentarians led by Mr. Munir Khan Orakzai, MNA including that despite adverse law and order situation all efforts would be made to complete the draft electoral rolls verification exercise by the target date of 30 September 2011 throughout the country.
September 25, 2011	Sindh PPP urged the ECP to extend the date for verification of draft electoral rolls by one or two months to enable the rain-affected people to get their names enlisted after returning to their homes. (Newspapers Reports)

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

September 27, 2011	ECP, asserting its independence, rejected Interior Ministry's 'directive' that ECP should route all communications with NADRA through the Ministry of Interior.
September 29, 2011	ECP decided to extend the deadline for completion of on-going verification of draft electoral rolls by one month up to 31 October 2011. ECP noted that the verification process has made 50 % progress in Sindh, 70 % in KP and Balochistan and 80 % in Punjab. Overall progress is assessed to be 70 %. (Newspaper Reports)
September 29, 2011	NADRA estimated that there would be around 84 million voters in the final electoral rolls. (Newspaper Reports)
October 1, 2011	A 5-member delegation of PML-N expressed concern to ECP over the increase in new Census Blocks from 104,000 to 140,000 and its disproportionately high increase (79%) in Sindh and decrease in Balochistan. Party feared that this could affect the population census as well. (Newspaper reports)
October 7, 2011	Consultative meeting was convened by the ECP in Peshawar with justice (Rtd) Shehzad Akbar, member ECP from KP in the chair. Many people expressed concerns regarding alleged registration of Afghan refugees as voters, maltreatment of enumerators at the hands of public, low remuneration for enumerators, lack of provision of identification cards to enumerators etc. (Newspaper reports)
October 31, 2011	ECP Secretary briefed the Commission meeting that 99 % work on the door to door verification of Electoral Rolls has been completed despite floods and adverse law and order situation in some parts of the country. He further said that ECP would hand over the collected data to NADRA before 15 November 2011 for scanning, data entry and printing purposes. The resulting preliminary electoral rolls (PERs) will then be displayed nationwide for 21 days at 50,000 display centres for inviting claims, objections and corrections. The ECP directed the NADRA Chairman to take all possible steps to ensure registration of all citizens 18 years or older. Chairman NADRA briefed about the process involved in preparation of Preliminary Electoral Rolls (PERs) and assured that NADRA will complete the process of scanning, data entry and printing etc within the stipulated time. The ECP also directed Chairman NADRA Mr. Ali Arshad Hakeem to take all possible steps to ensure registration of all 18 years citizens and overcome the problems being faced by the people in obtaining CNICs. Chairman NADRA assured the ECP that all the complaints have been noted down and he will personally look into the matters and will issue directions to resolve the problems immediately. ECP introduce the SMS service to be provided to the voters for verification their individual records.
November 2, 2011	ECP Secretary given 2 year extension on contract basis starting from 5 November 2011. (Newspaper Reports)
November 9, 2011	ECP submitted a report to the Supreme Court of Pakistan on the progress on preparing new electoral rolls
November 18, 2011	ECP handed over data collected during the country-wide door to door verification campaign to NADRA.

November 28, 2011	The ECP, after hearing the Attorney General for Pakistan as well as the applicants and objectors and keeping in view the opinion of the Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs, views of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Kashmir Affairs and Gilgat Baltistan, has announced the Order on 17 November 2011 for enrolment of the names of the citizens of Azad Jammu & Kashmir, residing in Pakistan, who are in possession of CNICs issued by NADRA in the electoral rolls of Pakistan, as voters subject to their fulfillment of legal requirement prescribed under Sections 6 and 7 of the Electoral Rolls Act, 1974.
November 30, 2011	The Commission approved providing SMS facility to the public for checking their vote registration, particulars etc and fixed nominal SMS charges for public i-e Rs.2.00 per SMS
December 21, 2011	Supreme Court directed ECP to complete electoral rolls by 23 February 2012 and submit progress reports to the Supreme Court every two weeks.
December 22, 2011	<p>ECP announced that it could not squeeze the schedule of completion of the new Electoral Rolls as directed by the Supreme Court. It issued a detailed press release giving reasons for the delay of, what it termed as, 'about 3 months' in completing the electoral rolls. The Press Release referred to the resolutions passed by the Provincial Assemblies of KPK and Balochistan on 19 September 2011 and 28 October 2011 respectively requesting extension in the deadline for door-to-door verification. A request for extension beyond 15 November 2011 was also received from Secretary Local Government on 1 November 2011 which was not agreed with by the ECP. A decision of the Sindh Cabinet was also publicized in the media on 26 September 2011 requesting ECP to extend the deadline for door to door verification.</p> <p>In view of the directions given by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan in its order, dated 21.12.2011, the ECP, under the Chairmanship of Hon'ble CEC Mr. Justice @ Hamid Ali Mirza held a meeting with Chairman and Deputy Chairman NADRA and asked them to expedite the work relating to data processing of the verified Draft Electoral Rolls and Forms handed over to NADRA by ECP and print the Preliminary Electoral Rolls as early as possible and in this regard all possible efforts be made and resources be employed for completing the assignment within the timeframe given by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan to comply with the order in letter and spirit, keeping in mind two factors:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>I) That the legal requirement of minimum three weeks for display of PER has to be observed; and,</li> <li>II) Accuracy of the data of PER and FER has to be ensured to avoid the same mistakes which were ommitted in 2007 to preclude the possibility of any bloodshed hinted at by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan</li> </ol>



## Appendix E

### Progress Report on Implementation of the 5-Year Strategic Plan As of December 31, 2011 (As provided by the ECP)

#### ELECTION COMMISSION OF PAKISTAN

##### Progress Report on Implementation of the Five-Year Strategic Plan

The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) launched its Five-Year Strategic Plan on 25 May 2010. The ECP developed the Plan in consultation with various stakeholders including political parties, civil society organizations, political workers, lawyers, female councilors, minority groups and international organizations - with technical assistance from IFES. The overarching goal of the SP is to build the ECP's capacity and to turn it into a modern election management body that fulfills its constitutional mandate of conducting free, fair and impartial elections.

Following is an update (from May 2010 to December 2011) on the progress made by the ECP in implementing the Strategic Plan:

##### Goal #1: Legal Framework

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Support the revision and reform of the legal framework for the better management of election process	Dec 2010	The draft of the legal reforms package has been developed with IFES assistance. It has been reviewed by the Legal Framework Committee established by the Election Commission of Pakistan through its Order No. 12(3)/2008-Res dated 7 Sep 2010 in line with the requirements of the Strategic Plan. The Committee has finalized the draft unified law, "The Election Act, 2011", which also contains suggestions for amending the existing law. It is now to be placed before the Election Commission for consideration. Thereafter, it will be sent to the National Assembly's Standing Committee on Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs for consideration.	
# 2. Support the unification of different election laws for their easy understanding and use	Dec 2011	The draft of the unified law has been prepared with the help of legal experts engaged by IFES Pakistan. The draft of unified law, "The Election Act, 2011" has been finalized by the Electoral Legal Framework Committee in its last meeting held in November, 2011. Unified law consists of existing five main laws governing election activities and also contains consequential amendments necessitated due to passing of Eighteenth and Nineteenth Amendment to the Constitution as well as some suggested amendments in line with the vision and objectives of the Strategic Plan. Once this law is approved / passed, the Committee will undertake consolidation of various existing Rules.	
#3. Enhance public understanding of the election law, through the translation and dissemination of election laws in Urdu	Dec 2010	ECP's Electoral Legal Framework Committee proposed that it would be more appropriate if Urdu translation of Election Laws is undertaken only after Unified Election Law is passed by the Parliament.	
#4. Develop legally binding regulations to improve the conduct of elections and to implement new legal requirements	Regular	Need-based –  Once unified law is adopted there will be need to draft procedures/ regulations in view of the changes introduced	

##### Goal #2: Registration of Voters and Electoral Rolls

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Improve the existing computerised electoral rolls system (CERS)	Jun 2010	Considerable progress has been achieved with regard to the revision of electoral rolls in collaboration with NADRA. The ECP handed-over the existing electoral rolls data to NADRA in February 2011 for verification, updating and augmentation of Electoral Rolls 2006-07 on the basis of CNIC database. During Housing Census by the Population Census Organization in April 2011,	



		<p>the head of family data was collected on a specially designed form for preparing Preliminary Electoral Rolls on the basis of new census blocks as prescribed by the Census Organisation which have been adopted by the ECP as electoral areas. This data was handed over to NADRA offices at district level. NADRA used this data for assignment of new census block codes after verification, updating and augmentation of existing electoral rolls data with NADRA's citizen/CNIC data. NADRA prepared Preliminary Electoral Rolls on the basis of new census blocks, using CNIC as unique identifier of voters. The ECP conducted country-wide door-to-door verification of these rolls in August-October 2011. NADRA is in the process of entering data changes on the basis of voters' data forms collected during door-to-door verification in light of guidelines/business rules, using double-blind data entry mechanism. Thereafter, the Preliminary Electoral Rolls shall be printed by NADRA and delivered to the ECP's field offices by 23 February 2012. The ECP shall display the Draft Electoral Rolls at 52,168 Display Centers across Pakistan for public display for inviting Claims, Objections and Applications for Corrections on the prescribed forms as per existing legal framework. After incorporating the decisions of the Revising Authorities the Final Electoral Rolls shall be published in May 2012.</p> <p>The ECP has established Project Management Unit comprising ECP and IFES officials to steer and monitor this gigantic task.</p> <p>To maintain and update the revised electoral rolls being prepared in collaboration with NADRA, the CERS-II is required to be modified with enhanced functionality and additional modules. The ECP's in-house capacity needs to be strengthened to maintain the application software and electoral rolls database in a professional approach.</p>	
#2. Enter into agreement with NADRA for computerised electoral rolls	May 2010	The Contract /Agreement between the ECP and NADRA for the revision of electoral rolls has been signed.	
# 3. Pilot project for ECP-NADRA collaboration	Jun 2010	Pilot project for updating/augmenting electoral rolls with NADRA collaboration was completed in November 2011. NADRA-verified-updated-augmented electoral rolls were verified in 60 selected electoral areas of four districts through door-to-door verification with the technical assistance and support of IFES. The pilot has helped in great deal in identifying issues during field exercise which were taken care of while rolling out the national level verification exercise.	
#4. Verify, validate, update and augment electoral rolls with NADRA database	Dec 2010	Covered under objective#1 above	
# 5. Legislation on mandatory condition of CNIC for voter registration leading to accuracy in the electoral rolls	Sep 2010	<p>The Election Laws (Amendment) Bill 2011, passed by the Parliament to make possession of computerized national identity card (CNIC) a mandatory condition for voter registration and casting of vote after President's assent has come into force.</p> <p>The Bill was drafted by the ECP and was first moved in the Senate by the Government. It was passed by the Senate and then the National Assembly and was finally signed by the President of Pakistan on 9 June 2011.</p>	
#6. Create infrastructure at the ECP for maintaining voters' data	Dec 2010	The ECP has opened the tenders to purchase the state of the art IT equipments.	
#7. Conduct a study into the engagement of female enumerators with a view to	Dec 2010	Instead of going for a formal study on this issue the ECP Taskforce for the Revision of Electoral Rolls has thoroughly discussed and deliberated on it and decided	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

appointing them to better serve the female population		not to engage female enumerators because of law and order situation. Such engagement will require extra security arrangements and may still have the element of risk for the female enumerators – or verifying officials.	
#8. Simplify voter registration forms—amendments	Jul 2010	Forms reviewed. Two new forms introduced for house-to-house verification of draft electoral rolls.	
#9. Conduct a study into introduction of photographs in the electoral rolls	Nov 2010	The Commission has approved electoral rolls with photographs and thumb impression to be used by the presiding officers. The proposal was discussed with the political parties and other electoral stakeholders. After thorough deliberations, it was approved by the Election Commission.  A proposal to amend law for providing photographs and digitized ink thumb impressions of voters on FER has been sent to National Assembly's Standing Committee.	
#10. Improve the display of draft electoral rolls and accessibility to voters	Dec 2011	ECP in collaboration with IFES has finalized its strategy for a comprehensive display process during display of Preliminary Electoral Rolls and easy accessibility of voters to facilitate the citizens in filing Claims, Objections and Applications for Corrections.  A massive awareness campaign is being launched to ensure maximum participation of voters.	
#11. Extension of CERS project to country wide field offices	Dec 2011	Once updated, accurate and credible electoral rolls are prepared and the necessary infrastructure is in place, this objective will materialize. To achieve this CERS needs to be operational at the ECP secretariat and the provincial offices.	
#12. Revise the electoral rolls annually in the month of January each year as required by the Constitution	January each year	No revision of electoral rolls has taken place in 2008, 2009 and 2010. However, in 2011, the ECP has finalized its plan for revision of electoral rolls in collaboration with NADRA, followed by door-to-door verification and comprehensive display process. For subsequent annual revision of electoral rolls, different approaches are being considered by the ECP, including registering voters and updating of voter's data when they visit NADRA offices for issuance of CNIC or renew CNIC to incorporate changes in their personal details.	

## Goal # 3: Election Operations

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Identify new buildings and facilities for establishing accessible polling stations #5. Establish permanent polling stations across the country	#1. Dec 2010 #5. Jun 2011	Efforts are being made to establish permanent polling stations so that the voters could be assigned to polling stations well before the elections. The lists of permanent polling stations shall be placed on the ECP's website for information of general public and enabling the voters to know the location of their polling stations through the use of SMS facility. Necessary amendments required in the law/rules are being worked out. Committees are being constituted at district level to identify and verify the buildings to be proposed for declaring permanent polling stations. The PECs shall conduct survey in their respective provinces by the end of March 2012 and identify public buildings to be declared as permanent polling stations and submit their	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		proposals to JS (Election) for placing before the Election Commission for declaring such buildings as permanent polling stations.	
#2. Establish a recruitment and hiring system for temporary election staff that is transparent and results in the recruitment of qualified, non-partisan, and diverse staff	Dec 2010	<p>The Electoral Legal Framework Committee has suggested an amendment in the Representation of the People Act, 1976, to enable Election Commission to hire temporary election staff during elections.</p> <p>The list of government servants belonging to the provincial and federal governments are being obtained who are now going to be trained as Returning Officers (DROs, ROs and AROs).</p> <p>Nevertheless, there is still a need to set up a system.</p>	
#3. Establish a database for polling staff, including a performance review system, to facilitate hiring of well-performing staff for future electoral events	Dec 2010	<p>List of government servants obtained. An elaborate database will be developed to maintain the data of well-performing staff.</p> <p>Initially lists of the officers, who are likely to be appointed as DROs and ROs for next general elections, have been obtained. A Plan to train them for their role in elections is ready for implementation in next two to three months.</p>	
#4. Conduct feasibility study on the use of electronic voting machines	Jun 2010	<p>Feasibility study report on the use of EVMs (electronic voting machines) has been completed. ECP, with IFES assistance, also arranged an EVM demonstration from international and national vendors and invited political parties and civil society organizations to participate and provide their input to the discussion. Political parties and civil society organizations are in favor of introducing EVMs for conduct of elections in the country. The study covers all relevant aspects for introducing EVMs. ECP has constituted a Committee to</p>	
		<p>plan and conduct Pilot project for introduction of EVM. The Committee held two meetings and has almost finalized technical and functional specifications of an EVM, which will be most suitable in Pakistan's socio-political environments.</p> <p>ECP held a presentation by five EVM vendors both national and international in December 2011 – specifically for the members of the Election Commission. It is part of the process to introduce EVMs through careful deliberations and clarity. Final specifications of the EVM prototype are being finalized.</p>	
#6 Explore devising a system for CCTV monitoring of sensitive polling stations	Jun 2011	No work initiated	
#7. Create linkage between polling stations and the computerised electoral rolls database	Dec 2011	Depends on early preparation of electoral rolls based on the NADRA database. It is connected with Goal#2 of the Strategic Plan and also with availability of IT equipment.	
#8. Gradual increase in the number of polling stations for facilitating voters, including the number of polling stations dedicated to female voters	Dec 2012	This objective will be achieved while pursuing objective 1 and 5 of this goal, which deal with setting up new and permanent polling stations.	
#9. Simplify all election related forms	Dec 2011	An ECP Committee has looked into various Forms to simplify them. The forms will be placed before the Legal Framework Committee in order to simplify them and if possible reduce their number. Some forms were also reviewed by the Result Management Committee headed by the Joint Secretary (Election).	

#10. Establish an efficient results management system to compile election results in shortest possible time	Dec 2012	For development of an efficient results management system to compile election results in shortest possible time, a taskforce is required to be constituted. This is also linked with the Objective # 2 of the Goal # 10 (Strengthening of IT infrastructure across the ECP field offices). ECP constituted a committee comprising its officials and IFES officials to work at the improvement of the result management system. A few deliberative meetings took place early 2011 but not much progress was made because of ECP's focus on electoral rolls. On 1 December 2011 the ECP advised UNDP to provide a framework as to how they would like to assist the ECP in improving the current results management system.	
#11. Publish polling station-wise results on the ECP website immediately after the results are available	Jun 2013	ECP puts scanned copies of polling station wise results on its website which is difficult to use for any kind of analysis. ECP will need to have data that could be used for effective analysis. ECP's IT directorate will work on this and provide a more professional solution. Assistance will be solicited from IFES and with latest decision, based on 1 Dec brainstorming session of the ECP, UNDP will also provide assistance.	
#12. Review the guidelines/code of conduct for polling agents	Dec 2010	The ECP constituted a Code of Conduct Committee comprising ECP and IFES officials to draft codes of conduct for political parties, polling personnel, media, observers and security personnel for the future elections in consultation with the electoral stakeholders. The Committee has completed its work and the drafts of these Codes will now be presented to the five-member Election Commission soon. ECP will hold consultations with electoral stakeholders in January in order to get their input and ensure that there is acceptance of the Code by them. However, the Codes do not cover polling agents. There are ECP guidelines for the polling agents, which need to be reviewed and improved.	
#13. Examine the system of the current postal ballot with a view to improving and examining the possible use of mobile polling stations	Oct 2010	Since ECP has decided to extend right of voting through Postal Ballot to Pakistanis living abroad, it has become imperative to revisit the existing laws and procedure in order to make them more user friendly. With IFES assistance, the ECP is developing a system which could cater to the overseas Pakistanis.	
#14. Write and adopt a booklet with information about elections, eligibility and nomination procedures for candidates	Jun 2011	The Election Commission has, in principle, approved introduction of Nomination Paper Booklet for the next general elections. The Booklet was originally developed in 2008. It has been reviewed by the ECP's Legal Framework Committee assisted by IFES. As Code of Conduct for political parties and candidates is under review of the ECP, the Booklet will be ready for printing soon after its approval. The Booklet will be translated in Urdu.	
#15. Enhance access for election observers to the electoral process	Dec 2012	ECP's Legal Framework Committee has deliberated on this aspect in the process of unification of election law and overall electoral legal reforms. It will be part of the package to be sent to the Government/Parliamentary Committee on Electoral Reforms by the ECP.	
#16. Delimit constituencies for National and Provincial Assemblies	Dec 2012	This objective is connected with goal#10, objective # 7 (GIS) – introduction of GIS. Delimitation is done after each census; census was due in 2008, and was delayed due to numerous factors until 2011. The Housing Census has been completed but population census planned for September 2011 has been postponed. The Census Organization has increased the number of census blocks from 100,000 to 140,000. The ECP is in contact with Census Organization to obtain complete data of new census blocks which have been adopted as electoral areas. Fresh delimitation of	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		National and Provincial Assemblies constituencies will be possible after conduct of census and compilation of population statistics by the Census Organization. However, re-description of constituencies required due to administrative changes will be completed by the end of first quarter of 2012. To support this process GIS system will be developed.	
#17. Review the current list of election symbols and improve their quality	Mar 2012	On the basis of feedback from political parties during consultations with them, ECP has reviewed the existing list of election symbols. A Summary to the President has been moved to amend relevant Rules thereby deleting some of the existing symbols and adding some new ones. This summary is likely to receive approval of the President in January, 2012.	
#18. Improve quality of voting material	Regular basis	ECP will undertake a thorough review of the quality of election material with a view to improve it.  ECP is reviewing specifications of the ballot boxes to be used in future elections. Budget Wing in consultation with Election Wing is working out the requirement of additional ballot boxes, plastic seals and voting screens.	
#19. Enhance security arrangement for polling stations	Regular basis	Various meetings with law enforcement agencies took place showing the seriousness of the issue. However, there are incidents of violence during some of the bye-elections which requires the ECP to put together a more effective mechanism for ensuring security at polling stations. On 16 September 2010 the ECP held a meeting with concerned federal and provincial ministers and chief secretaries of the provinces to ensure maximum security at polling stations and prevention of violence. ECP issued directives to provincial chief secretaries to ensure security during bye-elections.  ECP has reviewed – Dec 2011 - its security cover for Presiding Officers who enjoy the powers of Magistrate Class-I on polling day, but never utilized these powers. ECP is putting together measures to ensure maximum security on polling stations and giving more clarity to Presiding Officers and security personnel in their roles and responsibilities. A District Election Security Committee headed by DRO is being proposed which will comprise representatives of District Administration and other law enforcing agencies.	

## Goal # 4: Election Complaints and Disputes Resolution

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Designate officers to deal with pre-poll, poll-day and post-poll complaints at the ECP Secretariat and PEC offices	Jun 2010	-	
#2. Ensure appropriate legislation for development of electoral disputes resolution system	Jul 2011	The objective is being covered in the legal reform package – under goal#1.	
#3. Establish complaint management committees at district level for disposal of complaints	Jun 2012	Once the legal reform package is adopted in the law the committees will be formed accordingly. The Electoral Legal Framework Committee has proposed legal cover for this Objective in the Unified law.	
#4. Put in place a complaint tracking system at district level by using IT	Dec 2012	IT-based complaint tracking system is already in place at the ECP. However, to have it at the district level improvement in the IT infrastructure is needed. It is expected that the target will be achieved by set timelines. This is linked with the Objective # 2 of the Goal # 10 (Strengthening of IT infrastructure across ECP field offices).	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

## Goal # 5: Restructuring the Election Commission of Pakistan

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Develop and approve the re-organisation plan, including budgets	Apr 2010	It is part of the Strategic Plan – See annex B, C and D, which is approved by the CEC.	
#2. Organisational re-structuring of the Election Commission of Pakistan at the Secretariat as well as Provincial, Divisional and District levels	Apr 2010	As a first step towards the main objective of re-organizing/re-structuring the ECP, CEC has upgraded all positions in BPS-1 to 20 –both in the Secretariat and in the field offices. Some of the posts have been re-designated to make them compatible with changing situations. The officials and officers in the Secretariat and field offices have been upgraded /promoted to next pay scale using the mechanism for upgrading all officials without any discrimination. About 285 new posts of Assistants and Data Entry Operators have been created for the district offices.  With respect to FEA 4 positions -one Additional Director general (Training) and four Directors - are now available for TRE Wing, which are now being filled in.  JS-TRE has been re-designated as JS-LGE and Deputy Secretary (Elections) has been promoted as Additional Director General (Training).  However, the Section Officer (Electoral Rolls) has now been re-designated as Section Officer (Confidential). No progress on ER officer.  The trainers – 2 Pakistani nationals - at FEA are being funded by IFES. The ECP has succeeded in getting sanctioned some posts exclusively for training purposes, which also include the post of Additional Director General (Training, Research & Evaluation) and 4 positions for Directors. The process of filling these posts has started.	
#3. Establish a Legal Unit headed by a Deputy Secretary in the ECP to strengthen internal capacity on electoral legislation and the practices	Jul 2010		
#4. Establish a Training, Research and Evaluation Wing to be headed by a Joint Secretary	Jul 2010		
#5. Upgrade DG IT to BS 20 and provide additional posts for IT Directorate, on need basis	Jul 2010		
#6. Establish an Electoral Rolls Unit at the ECP Secretariat headed by a Deputy Secretary	Apr 2010		
#7. Strengthen the Federal Election Academy with the provision of permanent staff and management structure	Dec 2010		

## Goal # 6: Logistics, Infrastructure and Equipment for Election Commission of Pakistan

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Conduct a comprehensive need assessment of the ECP's infrastructure, logistics and equipment	Nov 2010	The goal as a whole has made no progress, mainly due to non-availability of funds. Two out of 11 objectives had been set for 2010 – Objective 1 and 11. There are three objectives to be achieved during 2011 (7, 8 & 10). Rest of the objectives are for 2012 (5, 6 & 9) and 2014 (2, 3, & 4). Major funding requirements of the Strategic Plan are related to this goal.  <i>IT equipment is being purchased through USAID. Furniture etc would be purchased out of the regular budget. Funds need to be arranged for offices.</i>  This goal will consume nearly 60% of the 100 million dollars estimated budget of the Strategic Plan over 5 years. USAID initially indicated to provide 35 million dollars for the Strategic Plan, however, this amount has been reduced to only 8.5 million dollars but nothing has been materialized so far.	
#2. Construct/purchase ECP buildings for housing the field offices, to the extent of resources available	Dec 2014		
#3. Construct housing units for ECP employees	Dec 2014		
#4. Construct ECP warehouses for election materials	Dec 2014		
#5. Construct additional building (space) for the ECP's Federal Election Academy	Dec 2012		
#6. Construct additional space for Court Room at the ECP Secretariat	Dec 2012		
#7. Replace/purchase suitable vehicles for the district offices, divisional offices, Provincial headquarters and ECP Secretariat	Jun 2011		
#8. Purchase computers, scanners, printers,	Jun 2011		
			A request has been sent to the Government of Pakistan to allot a plot in H-10 Sector for construction of an academy. Meanwhile new buildings are being rented for Federal Election Academy.  The vehicles have been purchased.  Being purchased.

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

photocopiers, furniture items, etc			
#9. Develop logistics plans for the conduct of elections	Dec 2012		
#10. Review and maintain computer-based inventory of electoral supplies and other material and equipment	Mar 2011		
#11. Adopt a policy for engaging private vehicles for the conduct of elections	Dec 2010		

## Goal # 7: Human Resources – Staffing and Compensation

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Develop a comprehensive HR policy for the ECP	Sep 2010		
#2. Review and updating of the Election Commission (Officers and Servants) Rules, 1969 to achieve various objectives	Jun 2010	Working closely with the ECP, IFES has extended its assistance by hiring a human resources expert. Through a comprehensive internal consultative process and review of the existing policies the expert has been able to come up with draft job description of all ECP positions.	
#3. Prepare Terms of Reference/Job Descriptions for each position in the ECP	Oct 2010		
#4. Establish policy for initial appointment of officers into Basic Pay Scale (BPS)-17 – Election Service of Pakistan	Dec 2010	A detailed HR policy has also been developed. Besides outlining the ways and means to improve recruiting process, promotion policy and training plans, the HR policy document also contains job description of about 40 positions in the ECP.	
#5. Increase pay structures to retain efficient officers through additional allowance	May 2010	A human resource policy document has been prepared. Likewise, the service rules are being reviewed along with promotion policy which needs to be finalized.	
#6. Review the existing promotion policy and introduce a progressive policy, enabling efficient officers to rise within the organisation	Jun 2010		
#7. Ensure that eligible women have at least 10% representation in the ECP jobs	Jun 2013	ECP and IFES are doing an assessment of gender issues with regard to women participation in elections and inclusion of women in the ECP jobs. The assessment will be followed by a strategy to improve women role in electoral processes. Instructions have been issued to meet the quota requirements.	
#8. Ensure that eligible persons with disabilities have at least 2% representation in the ECP jobs	Jun 2013		
#9. Ensure that eligible minorities have at least 5% representation in the ECP jobs	Jun 2013		
#10. Create a pool of former and serving officers (people with honesty and integrity) for election related functions	Dec 2010	A pool of former officers is being identified from amongst the officers of the federal and provincial services.	
#11. Prepare the ECP officers for the roles of DROs, ROs and AROs and creation of an independent cadre	Dec 2010	19 ECP officers have been trained for the role of DROs/ ROs.  46 ECP officers have been trained as Master Trainers to train about 1200 DROs/ROs. Federal Election Academy is preparing a comprehensive training plan for the training of DROs, ROs and AROs for forthcoming general elections.  It is expected that this training will be completed by end of March 2012.	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

## Goal # 8: Finance and Budget

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Ensure complete financial autonomy through relevant legislation on the pattern of National Assembly and Senate	Dec 2010	A proposal has been sent to the Prime Minister.	
#2. Computerized the Budget Wing for easy operation and effective controls	Jun 2011	-	
#3. Raise funds for the implementation of the Strategic Plan	2010-2014	Government of Pakistan is providing necessary funds for the purpose.  Donors have also fielded a scoping mission to identify electoral reforms needs of the ECP in July 2011. Around the same time UNDP brought in their assessment mission to decide about their engagement in support of ECP.  IFES and UNDP presented their plans to the Election Commission on 17 and 18 October 2011 respectively. The Commission welcomes support from the two. IFES based its plan on the five-year strategic plan of the ECP and the letter issued by the ECP to CIDA and recommendations of the scoping mission, and UNDP project has sprung out from their assessment mission report and has been sent to Economic Affairs Division for approval.	
#4. Assess and strengthen the current procurement policy (Supplies)	Jun 2010	A proposal will soon be prepared and presented for approval.	

## Goal # 9: Training, Research and Evaluation

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Strengthen the Federal Election Academy to make it a model training institution	Dec 2011	Four positions for the FEA have been sanctioned and the ECP has started recruitment process with issuance of a newspaper advertisement. The positions include – an Additional Director General and 4 Directors. The Government has been requested to allot a plot in H-10 Sector for construction of anew full fledged academy. Meanwhile, buildings are being rented out to meet the requirement.  IFES continues to provide a two training specialists to FEA as part of its training and capacity building assistance to the ECP.	
#2. Build capacity of all employees through continuous training	Dec 2014	409 ECP Officers – Deputy Election Commissioners, Assistant Election Commissioners, Election Officers, Section Officers, and Superintendents - were given various trainings as part of capacity building efforts. The areas of training include:  - Election laws and procedures  - Communication skills  - Presentation skills  - Office procedures  - Training techniques	
#3. Conduct specific programmes, courses, workshops for various officials	Dec 2014		



		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Financial management</li> <li>- Team building</li> <li>- Roles and Responsibilities as DRO/RO</li> <li>- Time management</li> <li>- Work ethics and behaviors</li> <li>- Electoral rolls verification through ECP-NADRA collaboration</li> <li>- Dealing with stakeholders</li> <li>- Administration Management</li> </ul> <p>5210 Presiding Officers and Polling Staff trained through cascade training methodology during bye-elections. Thirty ECP officers (DECs, AECs) were trained as Mater Trainers who trained the presiding officers and polling officers for bye-elections.</p> <p>152 ECP officers were trained as Lead Trainers for the roll-out of Supervisors and Verifying Officials training for door to door Electoral Rolls revision 2011.</p> <p>2,295 Registration Officers were trained as Master Trainers by 152 ECP Lead Trainers for the roll-out of Supervisors and Verifying Officials training before door to door electoral roll revision.</p> <p>166,994 Verifying staff (including 125,533 Verifying Officers and 41,461 Supervisors) was trained by Master Trainers for door to door Electoral Roll Revision 2011.</p>	
		<p>A plan has also being devised to provide orientation to over 600 officers for districts to function as Revising Authorities during electoral rolls display process. IFES is helping the ECP in doing this.</p>	
#4. Develop curricula for various training programmes	Dec 2011	<p>A variety of training material was produced/ revised including 6 different kinds of training manuals, 3 kinds of Resource Guides for Resource Persons / Trainers and 11 kinds of Handbooks for various ECP officials. The manuals and handbooks include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Trainer's manual for Capacity Building Training of AECs</li> <li>ii. Facilitators notes for training of ECP Officers for role of DRO, RO</li> <li>iii. Trainer's manual for Training of Master Trainers for Roll-out of Presiding Officers Training</li> <li>iv. Master Trainer's Manual for Presiding officers Training</li> <li>v. Trainers Manual for Polling staff Training</li> <li>vi. Handbook for Election Officers training</li> <li>vii. Handbook for District Returning Officers (Revised)</li> <li>viii. Handbook for Returning and Assistant Returning Officers (Revised)</li> <li>ix. Handbook for Presiding officers (Revised)</li> <li>x. Handbook for Polling staff (Revised)</li> <li>xi. Handbook for ECP officials training (at Provincial HQ)</li> <li>xii. Guldelines for Verifying Officials for ER Verification 2010 (Door to door verification</li> </ol>	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		<p>following ECP-NADRA collaboration</p> <p>xiii. Introduction to Information Technology &amp; Microsoft Office 2003.</p> <p>xiv. Booklet on "Tips for Conducting Effective Trainings"</p> <p>xv. Trainers Manual for the Training of Verifying officials for Electoral Roll revision</p> <p>xvi. Resource guide for AECs training</p> <p>xvii. Resource Guide for DROs/ROs training</p> <p>xviii. Resource Guide for Election Officers Training</p> <p>xix. Guidelines for the Display Center In-charge</p> <p>xx. Guidelines for the Revising Authorities</p>	
#5. Conduct Building Resources in Democracy, Governance and Elections (BRIDGE) training for ECP officials	Dec 2011	<p>13 Trainings have taken place in which 285 ECP Officers have been trained.</p> <p>Subject to availability of funds IFES and UNDP will assist the ECP in conducting BRIDGE training events for the ECP officers.</p>	
#6. Conduct research on contemporary electoral issues for providing input to ECP policy making processes	Dec 2014	<p>With IFES assistance a few activities have been undertaken:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- National workshop on political finance</li> <li>- First past the post (Pakistani system) versus various versions of proportional representation system</li> <li>- Specifications for electronic voting machines</li> </ul>	
#7. Undertake election-related study visits and trainings abroad	Dec 2014	<p>An ECP delegation visited Belgium to participate in a conference on elections/ technology and use of electronic voting machines in France and Belgium.</p> <p>CEC and Secretary ECP participated in the SAARC forum of Election Management Bodies in Bangladesh.</p> <p>Participation of ECP Officers in two events in India – Hyderabad and Delhi.</p> <p>ECP and High Commissioner of Maldives in Pakistan have been working on the possibility of exposure and exchange visits between both countries' election commission staff and also training of Maldives election commission staff at the ECP's FEA.</p> <p>The Chief Election Commissioner along-with Secretary ECP, JS (Elections) and DG (IT) visited India from 22 to 27 October to attend informal meeting of SAARC heads of EMBs hosted by Dr Anil Seal of Malaysian Commonwealth Study Centre. The ECP delegation also saw Indian EVMs demonstration and reviewed these devices from operational, procedural, technical and financial aspect.</p> <p>3 ECP IT officers are being sent to Dubai for training on Data Management – with IFES assistance. This will allow ECP to have the standards required to house the electoral rolls data.</p>	
#8. Monitor and evaluate all programmes and projects	Dec 2014	<p>This matrix is part of the progress monitoring of the implementation of the Strategic Plan. It is shared with all the wings. Secretary ECP himself regularly seeks updates and review progress.</p>	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		While the ECP is slow on some objectives, there are others which have been achieved much before the completion date.	
#9. Develop a pool of Resource Persons/Trainers for FEA	Dec 2011	<p>30 Deputy Election Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners trained as Master Trainers for the training of polling staff. 19 DECs and AECs have been trained in the role of DROs/ROs. They are the future resource persons for the ECP – building in-house capacity of the ECP.</p> <p>46 ECP officers have been trained as Master Trainers for the roll-out of DROs/ROs training for the next General Elections.</p> <p>152 Officers (AECs/DECs) were trained as Lead Trainers for roll out of Verifying Officials Training who in turn trained 2295 Master Trainers across country for the Electoral Rolls revision 2011 exercise.</p> <p>Planning is underway for training of 35 ECP officers in the conduct of election to Senate of Pakistan – based on Single Transferable Vote system. IFES and ECP officers are working on this together.</p>	
#10. Train polling officials for the next election, and include election related training in teachers' training curriculum/programmes	Dec 2012	First pilot of the cascade training was conducted in four constituencies. Keeping in view the learning from the pilot project, a national level cascade training model will be adopted for next General Elections. No progress on the inclusion of subject of election in teachers' training manual.	
		The matter was discussed in a day-long brainstorming session at the ECP on 1 Dec 2011 and later in a follow up review meeting held on 9 January. With IFES and UNDP assistance the ECP plans to train polling officials before the next general elections. Nevertheless, this depends on availability of funds.	
#11. Train political party agents	Dec 2012	It about time to start deliberation on this and draw a plan. FEA may be asked to do this. The number of these agents huge – and can be nearly 1.5 million across the country. It is thus imperative that FEA looks at goal #12, objective #5 (train political party representatives) and train a selected group of political party representatives who could take up guiding their respective agents on their role in elections.	
#12. Conduct trainings/briefings of election observers and media	Dec 2012	The objective is related to the next general elections – and such briefings will be organized at an appropriate time.	
#13. Conduct training of security personnel	Dec 2012	This is another important area which requires FEA's attention. ECP may devise guidelines for security personnel assigned to election duty and hand it over respective district police authorities.	
#14. Specialised IT training from authorised training centres abroad	Dec 2011	<p>The DG (IT) developed a plan "Training Required for ECP's IT Professionals". ECP will ensure to implement this training plan and seek external assistance where necessary.</p> <p>ECP is sending three of its IT officers to Dubai with IFES assistance to train them in data management in security – this will allow ECP to have the required standards in place to house the</p>	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		data of over 80 million voters at its secretariat.	
#15. Conduct IT skills training for officers and staff covering country-wide offices	Jun 2012	ECP with IFES assistance has arranged SQL Server 2008 and Windows Server 2008 training for 10 ECP/PECs IT professionals at a Karachi-based reputed institute.	
#16. Coordinate with donor agencies and facilitate donor assistance programmes	Dec 2014	A donor meeting was held at the ECP Secretariat in order muster support/funds for the Strategic Plan.  USAID's commitment of USD 35 million could not be materialized. IFES and UNDP are trying to muster donor assistance in support of the ECP strategic plan, electoral reforms, and electoral cycle.	
#17. Coordinate with Training Wing of the Establishment Division and other training institutes in the country for training of ECP officials	Dec 2014		

## Goal # 10: Information Technology

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Formulate a comprehensive IT policy for the ECP	Dec 2010	The draft IT Policy of the ECP was prepared by the IT Wing in collaboration with IFES in January 2011. On the instructions of the Secretary ECP the draft IT Policy for the ECP was sent to Ministry of IT, NTISB and NADRA to solicit their comments and feedback and to amend this document	
		appropriately. The reply/feedback from Ministry of IT, NTISB and NADRA is still awaited. No progress for last one year.	
#2. Strengthen the IT infrastructure at ECP offices across the country by computerising field offices and installing electronic communication	Dec 2011	The two objectives are connected with the procurement of requisite IT equipment to strengthen the IT infrastructure in the ECP offices across the country. In this regard, the IT Wing conducted requirement analysis and prepared a comprehensive Plan for Induction of IT Equipment and Technical Specifications along-with Tender Document in December 2010. The Admin Wing invited tenders from the reputed vendors through open bidding in April 2011. After thorough scrutiny by the ECP Procurement Committee, four bidders/vendors were short listed. No further progress.	
#3. Extend the ECP Intranet portal facility to all field offices	Jun 2012		
#4. Redesign the ECP website	Dec 2011	ECP has designed the new website which is operational since January 2010.	
#5. Restructuring the IT Directorate at the ECP Secretariat and IT set up in the PEC Offices	Dec 2010	This is part of the ECP's overall upgrading / restructuring of the various positions across the country and job descriptions under goal #5 and 7. For restructuring the IT Directorate at the ECP Secretariat and IT set-up in the PEC Offices, DG (IT) prepared an IT Restructuring Plan in June 2010 and submitted this document to the ECP management. However, no decision has been made in this regard.	
#6. Establish computerised electoral rolls data centre	Jun 2011	CERS-II has been developed by the ECP with IFES assistance wherein in-house capacity of the ECP has been strengthened to house electoral rolls data. To maintain and update the revised electoral rolls being prepared in collaboration with NADRA, the CERS-II is required to be modified	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		<p>with enhance functionality and additional modules. The ECP's in-house capacity need to be strengthened to maintain the application software and electoral rolls database in a professional approach.</p> <p>With IFES assistance the ECP has put in place necessary hardware and software to house the electoral rolls at the ECP Secretariat and PEC Offices. Additional IT equipment in view of the emerging requirements will be required which is linked with Goal # 2 above.</p>	
#7. Introduce a geographical information system to support the entire election process	Dec 2013	The GIS Committee comprising ECP and IFES experts was established to conduct Feasibility Study to explore and recommend possible GIS applications for the ECP, particularly the delimitation of constituencies. The committee has held numerous meetings and also explored potential GIS database sources like Survey of Pakistan, SUPARCO and Population Census Organization. The GIS committee report has been finalized and approved by the CEC. The ECP has yet to initiate GIS Pilot Project and establish GIS Lab which is linked with Goal # 2.	
#8. Develop and implement comprehensive information security and privacy policy	Jun 2011	Secretary ECP on 9 December 2010 constituted a technical committee, comprising DG (IT), Director MIS/CERS (ECP), Deputy General Manager Technology Integration (NADRA), Deputy Secretary National Telecom Information Security Board (NTISB), Section Officer (Ministry of Law) and Project Director (Ministry of IT) to develop information security framework to protect and safeguard the computerized electoral rolls system including recommendations on electoral rolls web	
		<p>hosting. The technical committee report is still awaited.</p> <p>Three ECP's IT professionals are being trained in "Information Security and Risk Management" at Dubai in collaboration with IFES. This training will be instrumental in strengthening ECP's in-house capacity to develop and implement comprehensive information security and privacy policy.</p>	

## Goal # 11: Public Outreach and Interaction with Political Parties, Civil Society Organizations and the Media

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Increase the level of interaction with political parties and the general public for enhancing confidence in electoral processes	Dec 2014	The ECP has established two formal forums for interaction/consultation – Political Party Consultative Forum; Civil Society Consultative Forum. The two forums have been consulted on Strategic Plan and the use of Electronic Voting Machine for elections in Pakistan.	
#2. Hold regular consultations with political parties and civil society organisations at the national, provincial and district levels	Dec 2014	<p>ECP held a consultation meeting with political parties in the third week of February 2011 focusing at the progress on the implementation of the Strategic Plan and other key areas including electronic voting machines, ECP-NADRA collaboration, election symbols, etc. Another meeting is being held on January 23, 2012.</p> <p>ECP intends to consult political parties and civil society organizations on the drafts of the conduct related to general elections. The consultation is</p>	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

		likely to take place during January 2012.	
#3. Develop and implement media outreach policy and strategy	Dec 2014		
#4. Establish a permanent Media Centre at the ECP	Dec 2011	This part of the IFES future assistance to the ECP. Work on this will start after February 2012.	
#5. Publish an ECP quarterly Newsletter	Dec 2012	ECP with IFES assistance developed design of the newsletter design. The newsletter has not been issued by the ECP.	

## Goal # 12: Political Parties and Candidates

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Reform legislation on political finance relating to political parties and candidates, strengthening financial accountability and enforcement mechanisms	Dec 2011	ECP organized a National Workshop on Political Finance in November, 2010, which was attended by the senior management of the ECP, representatives of major political parties and civil society organizations and other national and international stakeholders. Dr Marcin Walecki, an international expert on political finance, conducted the Workshop and made keynote presentation. There was consensus that basic reforms are required to contain role of money in electioneering. A report on the Workshop findings has been prepared and shared with all stakeholders.	Now it is time to implement the recommendations and decisions taken in this workshop as well as in the meetings held with political parties on 22 February 2011
#2. Develop regulations, mechanisms and procedures to implement legislative requirements concerning political finance	Dec 2011	The Electoral Legal Framework Committee of ECP is considering different proposals to make appropriate legal amendments for the implementation of main recommendations of political finance workshop.	
		ECP is setting up a political finance unit at its secretariat headed by financial Analyst for which necessary posts have been sanctioned. IFES is assisting the ECP in the development of the TOR for this unit.	
#3. Publish the financial statements of parliamentarians and political parties on the ECP website	Oct 2010	The meetings have been held with the Federal Board of Revenue and Auditor General of Pakistan. A roadmap has been prepared to move forward.	
#4. Strengthen the Code of Conduct for the political parties and contesting candidates	Jun 2011	ECP with IFES assistance has developed Codes of Conduct for various stakeholders including – political parties, election observers, media, polling personnel, and security personnel. The drafts have been finalized by the Code of Conduct Committee. This will follow review of the codes by the Commission and consultation with political parties and civil society organizations. It is expected that the codes will be approved during January-February 2012.	
#5. Train political party representatives and candidates on their electoral roles and responsibilities	Nov 2012	ECP will soon start work on this. Political parties' consultative forum will also be used for this purpose. This will contribute towards strengthening a more responsible political and electoral culture in Pakistan.	
#6. Make necessary changes in the existing Statement of Assets and Liabilities to make it simple and meaningful	Nov 2011	The meetings have been held with the Federal Board of Revenue and Auditor General of Pakistan. A roadmap has been prepared to move forward.	

## Goal # 13: Civic and Voter Education\*\*\*

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status	Remarks
#1. Conduct a baseline survey to determine participation rates among various sections of society (general, women, youth, persons with disabilities, minorities, urban/rural), factors influencing participation and knowledge about the electoral process to formulate voter education strategy	May 2010	The ECP with IFES assistance identified a Pakistani firm to undertake a survey with a sample size of 2000 in all the four provinces. A detailed questionnaire was developed and approved by ECP. After pre-testing of the questionnaire the nation-wide survey started on 3 January 2011. The field work was completed within three weeks. A detailed presentation based on the findings of the survey was given by MEMRB at the ECP. The survey provided significant input to the ECP voter education strategy.	
#2. Develop civic and voter education strategy, in consultation with civil society organisations and other governmental and non-governmental actors, to ensure information outreach to all sections of society	Dec 2011	The ECP with IFES assistance identified and inducted a national consultant to oversee the survey and start work on the national strategy on voter participation. An international expert from Australia was hired by IFES to help develop the strategy. Through stakeholder consultations the strategy was finalized and presented to the ECP management. It is being currently reviewed by the ECP.	
#3. Implement civic and voter education strategy, in collaboration with civil society partners and others	Dec 2012	In consultation with the ECP, IFES presented a district-based national voter outreach plan which was agreed by the Commission and the Secretary. However, no formal approval was granted. This intervention has the potential to revolutionize engagement of stakeholders at district level and increase voter turnout.	
#4. Increase the percentage of voter turnout from 44% (2008 Elections) to 63% of registered voters in 2013	Jun 2013	All these objectives will be the outcome of the voter education campaign plus other management, operational and administrative arrangements to be made by the ECP leading to the next general elections.	
#5. Increase the turnout of female voters	Jun 2013		
#6. Increase the turnout of minority voters	Jun 2013		
#7. Increase the number of persons with disabilities to vote in the elections	Jun 2013		
#8. Minimise the incidents of violence during elections through voter education	Jun 2013		
#9. Include voter education in the curricula at secondary/intermediate level in Pakistan Studies	Jun 2013	No progress is made as the objective is set to complete in 2013. However, ECP will soon start engaging the Ministries of Education in all the four provinces – as after 18 <sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment the ministry will be devolved.  The civic and voter education strategy covers this.	
#10. Develop youth specific awareness campaigns to engage them in electoral matters	Jun 2013	Youth segment of the society is one of the important components of the national voter education strategy. The objective will be covered under objectives 1, 2 and 3 above.  UNDP, as part of their assistance to the ECP plans to cover youth segment of society – to increase their participation.	

## State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

## 1st Quarterly Citizens Monitoring Report

**Goal # 14: Marginalized Groups including Women, Minorities and Persons with Disabilities**

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status		Remarks
#1. Support the development and adoption of legislation on the participation of persons with disabilities in the electoral process	Dec 2011	Amendments in the law have been proposed to the respective Standing Committees.		
#2. Conduct research on voting participation of persons with disabilities to understand the issue in depth and formulate relevant policies	Sep 2010	Some officers of ECP have been trained by IFES who are now formulating specific proposals.		
#3. Develop awareness materials highlighting the importance of the vote of every person, specifically targeting marginalised groups	Dec 2012	To be covered under national survey on voter participation and subsequent voter education strategy.		
#4. Conduct research on voting participation of women to formulate relevant policies	Jul 2011	ECP and IFES are in the process of conducting a gender assessment with focus on women in the ECP and women participation as voters. The assessment will be finalized in January and it is expected to have a strategic framework ready in February 2012.		
#5. Develop and implement policies and registration and voting procedures to increase electoral participation of women and marginalised groups	Dec 2010	Gender assessment and gender strategy to help achieve this.		
#6. Train ECP officials with respect to participation of persons with disabilities in the electoral processes	Dec 2011	In progress	Six trainings have been conducted for ECP officials (2 for Assistant Election Commissioners and 4 for Election Officers and Superintendents) in which 111 officials (33 AECs and 66 EOs and 12 Superintendents) participated an hour session on "Disability Equality i.e. inclusion of persons with disabilities in electoral process" at FEA. No further progress	

**Goal # 15: Branding of the Election Commission of Pakistan**

Objective	Completion Time lines	Latest Status		Remarks
#1. Develop a design for the divisional and district office buildings along with signboards that could be replicated all across the country	Dec 2010	It seems likely that the objective will miss the deadline as it is a lengthy process involving another government department – Public Works Department (PWD).		
#2. Develop and launch a media campaign around the vision and mission of the ECP	Dec 2014	It has already started with launching of the Strategic Plan.		
#3. Develop an ECP branding using specific colour combinations for all items it uses	Dec 2010	New designs were developed and presented in a meeting at the ECP. Comments were received and incorporated in the designs. However, no further progress was made.		





**Head Office: No. 7, 9th Avenue, F-8/1, Islamabad, Pakistan**  
**Tel: (+92-51) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-51) 226-3078**  
**Lahore Office: 45-A, Sector XX, 2nd Floor, Phase III Commercial Area, DHA, Lahore**  
**Tel: (+92-42) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-42) 3569 3896**  
**E-mail: [info@pildat.org](mailto:info@pildat.org)**  
**Web: [www.pildat.org](http://www.pildat.org)**